



Bioactive Materials for Caries Management: A Literature Review

Olivia Lili Zhang ¹, John Yun Niu ¹, Iris Xiaoxue Yin ¹, Ollie Yiru Yu ¹, May Lei Mei ^{1,2}, and Chun Hung Chu ^{1,*}

- ¹ Faculty of Dentistry, The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong, China
- ² Faculty of Dentistry, The University of Otago, Dunedin 9054, New Zealand
- * Correspondence: chchu@hku.hk

Abstract: Researchers have developed novel bioactive materials for caries management. Many clinicians also favour these materials, which fit their contemporary practice philosophy of using the medical model of caries management and minimally invasive dentistry. Although there is no consensus on the definition of bioactive materials, bioactive materials in cariology are generally considered to be those that can form hydroxyapatite crystals on the tooth surface. Common bioactive materials include fluoride-based materials, calcium- and phosphate-based materials, graphene-based materials, metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials and peptide-based materials. Silver diamine fluoride (SDF) is a fluoridebased material containing silver; silver is antibacterial and fluoride promotes remineralisation. Casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate is a calcium- and phosphate-based material that can be added to toothpaste and chewing gum for caries prevention. Researchers use graphene-based materials and metal or metal-oxide nanomaterials as anticaries agents. Graphene-based materials, such as graphene oxide-silver, have antibacterial and mineralising properties. Metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials, such as silver and copper oxide, are antimicrobial. Incorporating mineralising materials could introduce remineralising properties to metallic nanoparticles. Researchers have also developed antimicrobial peptides with mineralising properties for caries prevention. The purpose of this literature review is to provide an overview of current bioactive materials for caries management.

Keywords: antimicrobial; remineralisation; caries; peptides; prevention; bioactive; dental materials

1. Introduction

Dental caries is challenging to human health and society. It is the most common and worldwide biofilm-dependent disease [1], where nearly half of the population worldwide suffers from untreated caries [2,3]. The situation of high prevalence of early childhood caries could be improved with positive socio-behavioural factors [4]. Even though dental health care professionals have made significant efforts to control dental caries, the incidence rate over the past few years has remained high [5]. Caries prevalence has decreased only 4% from its level 30 years ago [6]. Dental caries result from demineralisation and remineralisation cycles at the interface of biofilm and tooth surface [7]. The demineralisation is caused by acid produced by oral biofilm. The new philosophy of caries management is minimal intervention, which aims to maintain the dental structure and pulpal vitality to prolong the tooth's life [8]. Minimal intervention highlights the "minimal" or "nonrestorative" techniques to control caries by inhibiting mineral loss [9]. However, the most common approach for caries management remains traditional drilling and filling [10], from which it is necessary to shift to a new concept: a medical model [11]. In addition, conditions such as white spot lesions and molar incisor hypomineralisation should also be considered precursors of dental caries [12,13]. These conditions should be managed in clinical settings using bioactive materials [12].

Therefore, researchers have developed novel bioactive materials for caries management [14]. In medicine, a "biomaterial" is an artificial substance that interacts with components of living systems [15]. The biomaterial can be used in therapeutic or diagnostic



Citation: Zhang, O.L.; Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Yu, O.Y.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. Bioactive Materials for Caries Management: A Literature Review. *Dent. J.* 2023, *11*, 59. https://doi.org/ 10.3390/dj11030059

Academic Editor: Stefania Cantore

Received: 23 December 2022 Revised: 20 February 2023 Accepted: 21 February 2023 Published: 23 February 2023



Copyright: © 2023 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/). medical procedures alone or as part of a complex system [15]. Alongside the development of biomaterials, the concept of "bioactive" materials has emerged. Bioactive materials elicit special chemical bonding at the interface between tissues and the material [16]. For example, fluoride-releasing materials are typical bioactive restorative materials in dentistry. They have been widely applied in clinical settings to prevent secondary caries because the fluoride-releasing material adheres to the tooth tissue and releases fluoride [17].

There is no consensus on the definition of bioactive materials. The term "bioactive" applies to a dental material and should describe a beneficial biological process in which the material actively stimulates specific tissue or cellular responses or interacts with pathogenic species [16]. Therefore, bioactive materials in cariology/restorative dentistry generally are considered materials capable of forming hydroxyapatite crystals on tooth surfaces. In addition, dental caries is a non-communicable, chronic and behaviour-mediated biofilm disease [18]. The biofilm form develops through a multi-stage process, including bacterial attachment, microcolony formation, biofilm maturation and biofilm dispersal [19]. A bioactive material intended to control caries should be able to disrupt any or all stages of biofilm formation.

In recent years, more bioactive materials with mineralising and/or antibacterial properties for caries treatment have emerged [14] with the development of nanotechnology [20]. Many clinicians also favour these materials that fit their contemporary practice philosophy of the medical model of caries management and minimally invasive dentistry [11]. Common bioactive materials for caries management include fluoride-based materials, calcium- and phosphate-based materials, graphene-based materials, metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials and peptide-based materials (Table 1).

Table 1. Desirable properties of various bioactive materials.

Bioactive Materials	Desirable Property (• Yes • Inconclusive • No)				
	Biocompatib	le Antibacterial	Stable	Nondiscolouring	Low-Cost
Fluoride-based materials					
Silver diamine fluoride [21]	•	•	•	•	•
Sodium fluoride [22]	•	•	•	•	•
Sodium monofluorophosphate [23]	•	•	•	•	•
Acidulated fluorophosphate [24]	•	•	•	•	•
Stannous fluoride [25]	•	•	•	•	•
Amine fluoride [26]	•	•	•	•	•
<i>Calcium- and phosphate-based materials</i> Casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate [27]	•	•	•	•	•
Casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium fluoride phosphate [28]	•	•	•	•	•
Functionalised tricalcium phosphate [29]	•	•	•	•	•
Nano-hydroxyapatite [30]	•	•	•	•	•
Calcium sodium phosphosilicate [31]	•	•	•	•	•
<i>Graphene-based materials</i> Graphene [32]	•	•	•	•	•
Graphene oxide and reduced graphene oxide [32]	•	•	•	•	•
Metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials					
Silver nanoparticles [33]	•	•	•	•	•
Zinc oxide nanoparticles [34]	•	•	•	•	•
Copper nanoparticles [35]	•	•	•	•	•
Peptide-based materials					
Antimicrobial peptides [36]	•	•	•	•	•
Mineralising antimicrobial peptides [37]	•	•	•	•	•
Mineralising peptides [38]	•	•	•	•	•

For example, silver diamine fluoride (SDF) can effectively prevent and arrest enamel and dentine caries [39,40]. In addition, peptides with antimicrobial and mineralising properties can inhibit cariogenic biofilm and promote remineralisation [36,38]. Ideal bioactive materials should be biocompatible, stable, non-discolouring and low cost [41]. Thus far, no previous review article describes the developing status of bioactive materials for caries management. The aim of this literature review is to provide an overview of current bioactive materials for caries management.

2. Fluoride-Based Materials

Fluoride is essential for the prevention of dental caries [21]. The World Health Organization passed a resolution stating that universal access to fluoride for caries prevention is a fundamental human right [42]. Water fluoridation is integral to oral health programs worldwide [43]. Fluoride inhibits demineralisation and enhances remineralisation of the teeth's hard tissue. Topical application of fluorides influences tooth surfaces. After fluoride therapy, a layer of calcium fluoride forms, which can be incorporated into the fluorapatite of the tooth surface [44]. All of these increase tooth minerals' acid resistance, or in other words, reduce the critical pH value of mineral dissolution. In addition, fluoride can play a role in inhibiting cariogenic biofilm [44].

Various formulations of fluoride-based materials in various fluoride concentrations are applied in dentistry. The most common formulations include SDF, sodium fluoride, sodium monofluorophosphate, acidulated fluorophosphate, stannous fluoride and amine fluoride. These fluoride-based materials can be delivered in various forms, including mouth rinses, toothpastes, foams, gels and varnishes [41]. The fluoride concentration, type of fluoride compound and frequency and duration of application significantly affect topical fluoride applications' efficacy in caries prevention [45].

The World Health Organization recommends the daily use of low-concentration fluorides in toothpaste, and it is believed that everyday fluoride toothpaste use is the main reason for the reduction of caries prevalence in past decades [46]. In addition, professional fluoride therapy to arrest active dental caries is an effective, low-cost and easily operated strategy [41].

2.1. Silver Diamine Fluoride

SDF was invented in the 1960s in Japan [47]. It is a fluoride-based material containing silver, fluoride and ammonia, with a pH value between 9 and 10. Silver is an effective antibacterial agent, and fluoride is an effective remineralisation agent. The most common concentration of SDF solution is 38% (44,800 ppm of fluoride), but 30% (35,400 ppm) and 12% (14,150 ppm) SDF solutions are also used [48]. Research has demonstrated that 12% SDF is less effective in arresting caries than more concentrated solutions [49,50]. In comparison, a 38% SDF solution can arrest 81% of dentine caries in primary dentition [51]. In addition, 38% SDF acts more quickly to arrest caries than 5% fluoride varnish does [52] and arrests root caries effectively [53]. SDF's advantages are that it is easy to operate, non-invasive, painless, non-aerosol-generating and inexpensive [47].

The World Health Organization recognised SDF as an important medicine [54]. SDF therapy is effective for caries arrest and prevention, especially for difficult-to-treat lesions and elderly patients or patients with difficulties in routine hygiene procedures [55,56]. However, it still induces some side effects, such as black staining and a metallic taste, which may cause dissatisfaction among children and parents [57]. Therefore, further research on the use of SDF should focus on mitigating these disadvantages.

2.2. Sodium Fluoride

Sodium fluoride is also one of the most-used fluoride materials. It can exist in the forms of 0.05% and 0.2% rinses, 2% gel and 5% varnish. As early as 1964, a varnish containing sodium fluoride in a natural colophony base was invented [58]. Sodium fluoride varnish is a slow-releasing reservoir that helps fluoride adhere to and stay on tooth surfaces in the oral environment [59]. Today, 5% (containing 22,600 ppm fluoride) sodium fluoride

varnish is suggested to be biannually applied in children and teenagers to prevent dental caries [60]. Serial studies have demonstrated that sodium fluoride varnish is safe [61] and cost-effective [59]. It can effectively reduce early childhood caries development in children [62,63]. In addition, sodium fluoride varnish effectively reverses initial caries and early enamel lesions [22,51]. However, the effect on arresting cavitated caries of sodium fluoride varnish is not ideal [64].

2.3. Other Fluoride-Based Materials

Other common fluoride-based materials include sodium monofluorophosphate, acidulated fluorophosphate, stannous fluoride and amine fluoride. Sodium monofluorophosphate is an active anticaries agent in toothpaste [23]. Toothpaste containing sodium monofluorophosphate showed efficacy similar to that of toothpaste containing sodium fluoride [23]. Acidulated fluorophosphate gel is the most commonly used professional topically applied fluoride gel [46,59]. However, topical application of acidulated fluorophosphate gel has no additional arresting effect on caries lesions [24]. Stannous fluoride has more antimicrobial properties than other fluoride compounds do [65,66]. Therefore, it has been widely used in many oral care products. However, stannous fluoride's stability is not ideal, and it may cause dark staining [25]. Amine fluoride is available in toothpastes, gels and mouth rinses [26]. It can reduce plaque adhesion and remain longer in the oral cavity because of its strong affinity with the enamel surface [25,67]. However, research on sodium monofluorophosphate, acidulated fluorophosphate, stannous fluoride and amine fluoride is insufficient, and their action mechanisms are still unclear. It is necessary to carry out more studies to confirm their clinical effectiveness.

3. Calcium- and Phosphate-Based Materials

The conception of "remineralisation" in cariology refers to mineral gain on the demineralised enamel and dentine surface [68]. The source of calcium and phosphate could be saliva or external sources. The saliva can help remineralise demineralised enamel crystals, but it is insufficient for tissue repair because saliva tends only to remineralise a lesion's surface layer. The reason for this limited scope of remineralisation is that the ion concentration gradient from the saliva into the lesions is low. Therefore, introducing various calciumand phosphate-based agents to provide abundant calcium and phosphate sources is a strategy of caries management. These kinds of materials include casein phosphopeptideamorphous calcium phosphate (CPP-ACP), casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium fluoride phosphate (CPP-ACFP), functionalised β -tricalcium phosphate, nano-hydroxyapatite and calcium sodium phosphosilicate [69,70].

3.1. CPP-ACP and CPP-ACFP

CPP-ACP comprises nanoclusters of casein phosphopeptide bound to amorphous calcium phosphate [27]. CPP stabilises calcium and phosphate ions by forming CPP-ACP complexes [71]. CPP-ACP promotes the remineralisation of subsurface lesions by supplying a high concentration of calcium and phosphate ions [68,72–74]. CPP-ACP products include chewing gums, mouthwashes and dental creams [68]. These products exhibit anticaries properties without unpalatability or allergenicity [75]. A 24-month clinical trial showed that chewing a CPP-ACP gum significantly reduced the progress of caries [72]. A 6-month clinical trial showed that a toothpaste containing CPP-ACP had a better reduction effect on *Streptococcus mutans*-positive children than did fluoride toothpaste alone or combined with both agents [76]. Some other studies showed that using 10% CPP-ACP cream over 12 months [77] and 24 months [78] can significantly reduce the number of *Streptococcus mutans*-positive children. However, it cannot significantly reduce caries prevalence. Comprehensive evidence has confirmed that although CPP-ACP has a remineralising property, it does not differ significantly from that of fluoride products [79]. Therefore, CPP-ACP can be used as an adjunct, not an alternative to fluorides [80].

CPP-ACPF came into being through the addition of 0.2% fluoride (900 ppm) to CPP-ACP [28]. CPP-ACPF has shown an increased remineralising effect thanks to the distribution of fluoride ions, calcium ions and phosphate ions, which enables substantial crystal growth and fluorapatite formation [28,74,81]. An in vitro study showed that combining CPP-ACFP with conventional toothpaste on initial caries lesions increased enamel's mineral content after 6 weeks and 12 weeks [82]. However, systemic evidence showed that CPP-ACPF is less effective than CPP-ACP alone [83]. It is necessary to design and conduct high-quality clinical trials to confirm the efficacy of CPP-ACP and CPP-ACFP for dental caries management.

3.2. Functionalised β-Tricalcium Phosphate

Another calcium phosphate system, β -tricalcium phosphate (β -TCP), is widely investigated in bone remodelling and orthopaedic applications [29]. β -TCP allows for crystal modification [29]. Therefore, researchers are trying to modify β -TCP to make it compatible with fluoride [21]. Functionalised β -TCP (fTCP) can create barriers to prevent interactions between fluoride and calcium. In addition, fTCP can target delivery of minerals and fluoride to the teeth's surface [84]. The minerals produced by the combination of fluoride and fTCP showed greater acid resistance than that of fluoride, β -TCP and fTCP [84,85]. However, the clinical evidence remains insufficient. Further research is needed to assess fTCP's effectiveness in caries remineralisation [70].

3.3. Nano-Hydroxyapatite Materials

Hydroxyapatite is the tooth's main component of hard tissue [86]. Nano-hydroxyapatite materials can be used for dental implant coating, desensitisation and remineralisation [87,88]. Nano-hydroxyapatite can directly fill and cover the demineralised enamel due to its strong affinity with enamel [30]. The filled nano-hydroxyapatite is the scaffold of remineralisation. It facilitates the gathering of calcium and phosphate from saliva to the enamel surface, forming a new apatite layer [30]. Even in acidic conditions, nano-hydroxyapatite still significantly increases remineralisation by attracting mineral ions into the demineralised zone [89]. In addition, nano-hydroxyapatite can increase hard tissue's micro-hardness and decelerate caries' development [90,91]. Several in vitro studies have found that nano-hydroxyapatite toothpaste can remineralise the artificial initial caries [92,93]. Moreover, nano-hydroxyapatite showed a better remineralising effect than fluoride varnish did [27]. However, the clinical evidence is still insufficient to support conclusions about the remineralising effect of nano-hydroxyapatite on dental caries [94].

3.4. Calcium Sodium Phosphosilicate

Calcium sodium phosphosilicate is a kind of bioactive glass which is another potential anticaries agent [31]. It is a stable composite of SiO₂, CaO and Na₂O. It has ideal biocompatibility without toxicity, inflammation or foreign-body response [31]. Calcium sodium phosphosilicate is dissolvable and can release sodium, calcium and phosphate in saliva. This is essential for generating a hydroxyapatite layer on the demineralised tooth surface [95,96]. Laboratory studies have demonstrated that calcium sodium phosphosilicate promotes remineralisation and inhibits demineralisation on enamel and dentine [97–99]. In addition, calcium sodium phosphosilicate also has broad-spectrum antimicrobial properties [100]. Although the FDA has approved calcium sodium phosphosilicate (Bioglass[®] 45S5) for clinical applications, the evidence of bioactive glass's clinical efficacy against caries is still insufficient [101].

Even though a series of calcium- and phosphate-based materials showed remineralising ability [102], no clinical evidence has shown that calcium- and phosphate-based materials could replace the common use of fluoride in the minimal intervention treatment for caries [103]. Calcium- and phosphate-based materials can be used to supplement fluoride treatments because the calcium and phosphate ions are necessary for forming fluorapatite [28]. In addition, in situ enamel remineralisation and fluoride retention in plaque depend on the availability of calcium ions [104].

4. Graphene-Based Materials

Graphene is a single flat sheet of carbon-based nanomaterial with an ideal twodimensional (2D) structure [32]. Unfortunately, it is not easy to synthesise large-scale graphene. Therefore, derivatives of graphene, such as graphene oxide (GO) and reduced graphene oxide (rGO), have been introduced because they are easier to produce [105]. Graphene and its derivatives have many applications in science and technology, including dentistry [32,106]. For caries management, graphene-based materials have anti-cariogenic pathogen capacities [107] and mineralising properties [108]. GO has active sites which allow for its functional combination with other bioactive molecules [109] whereas rGO is made by eliminating the oxygen in GO to induce graphene-like behaviour [110].

Researchers have found that GO can be combined with other materials to reveal its anticaries ability in vitro [105]. Nizami et al. found that GO-silver (Ag) and GO-Ag-calcium fluoride (GO-Ag-CaF2) prevented the demineralisation of dentine and inhibited the growth of *Streptococcus mutans* [108]. Wu et al. combined GO with Antisense vicR RNA, demonstrating its ability to reduce bacterial growth and suppress biofilm formation [111]. Khosalim et al. observed that GO can foster hydroxyapatite and improve the nano-hardness of dentine slices [112]. Zanni et al. indicated that zinc oxide nanorod-decorated graphene nanoplatelets inhibit the formation of *Streptococcus mutans* biofilm [113]. Mao et al. found that graphene oxide-copper nanocomposites could hinder the growth of *Streptococcus mutans* [114].

However, researchers still need to discuss graphene-based materials' biocompatibility and toxicity comprehensively [106]. Translation of graphene-based materials for clinical application is still distant.

5. Metal and Metal-Oxide Nanomaterials

Because nanotechnology offers a powerful defence against microbial proliferation, researchers have developed anticaries nanomaterials [34]. Various metal and metal-oxides, such as silver, zinc oxide and copper oxide, have antimicrobial abilities [34]. The antimicrobial mechanism of metallic nanoparticles includes metal ion release and oxidative stress induction. In addition, the nanoscale particle sizes increase the surface-to-volume ratio, which facilitates materials' damage to the extracellular polysaccharide bacterial matrix and the penetration of bacterial membranes [115]. Moreover, incorporating mineralising materials could introduce remineralising properties to metallic nanoparticles [116].

5.1. Silver Nanoparticles

Silver nanoparticles (AgNPs) have been widely studied [117]. AgNPs can inhibit the growth and adhesion of cariogenic pathogens, especially *Streptococcus mutans* [33]. AgNPs also have antiviral and antifungal qualities. Studies have demonstrated AgNPs' broad-spectrum antimicrobial properties in vitro [118]. Anticaries agent-based AgNPs have a practical bactericidal effect against *Streptococcus mutans* biofilm [119]. In addition, AgNPs can slow the demineralisation of teeth by inhibiting lactic acid production and collagen degradation by biofilm [120].

To add mineralising properties to AgNPs, researchers have tried to combine AgNPs with fluoride [119]. An in vitro study showed that the combination of fluoride sodium with AgNPs showed greater remineralisation efficacy than sodium fluoride alone and nano-hydroxyapatite on enamel [121]. However, another in vitro study showed that toothpaste containing AgNPs and fluoride sodium affected the demineralised enamel, such as sodium fluoride toothpaste [122]. In addition, Yin et al. found no significant difference between AgNPs with sodium fluoride and sodium fluoride alone in terms of the remineralising effect [33].

Nano-silver fluoride is an AgNP product comprising chitosan and fluoride. It has long-term stability and good biocompatibility and does not stain the enamel [123]. A randomised clinical trial showed that the yearly application of nano-silver fluoride arrested 66.7% of

dentine caries in primary teeth at 12 months [124]. Another clinical trial showed that annual nano-silver fluoride application prevented dentine caries' progression in primary molars [125]. In addition, the combination of AgNPs and fluoride sodium or nano-silver fluoride does not cause black staining and metallic taste, unlike SDF [120,126]. Apparently, the AgNPs' properties suggest their potential as an effective anticaries agent without black staining. However, nanoparticles' toxicity cannot be ignored. Studies have shown that toxicity depends on the concentration and types of silver nanoparticles [127]. Therefore, well-designed clinical trials are essential to prove further AgNPs' effectiveness for clinical application.

5.2. Zinc Oxide Nanoparticles

Zinc oxide nanoparticles have better antimicrobial properties and biocompatibility than zinc nanoparticles do [34,128]. Researchers have found that incorporating zinc oxide nanoparticles gives adhesives antimicrobial properties [129]. For example, Kasraei et al. found that composite resins containing zinc oxide or silver nanoparticles showed antimicrobial activity against *Streptococcus mutans* [130]. Swetha et al. found that pit and fissure sealants containing zinc oxide nanoparticles also showed antimicrobial activity [131].

5.3. Copper Nanoparticles

Copper nanoparticles also have shown effectiveness against cariogenic bacteria [35,132]. In addition, copper nanoparticles can achieve a better cost–benefit ratio than that of silver nanoparticles [34]. Covarrubias et al. synthesised copper chitosan hybrid nanoparticles with antimicrobial activities against *Streptococcus mutans* [133]. Altankhishig et al. demonstrated that incorporating zinc and copper nanocomposite gave the adhesive system antibacterial properties [134].

Metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials are antimicrobial. They can be combined with mineralising materials to enhance their anticaries properties. However, further research is necessary to translate nanomaterials for dental caries management into clinical settings.

6. Peptide-Based Materials

Peptides are usually strings of 2 to 50 amino acids [36]. Researchers seek peptides with antimicrobial and mineralising effects [135]. A series of datasets on peptides for caries management has been developed [136]. Some natural peptides are chemically modified to improve their activity and biocompatibility [137]. In addition, the shorter the peptide, the lower its production cost [138].

6.1. Antimicrobial Peptides

Antimicrobial peptides have attracted researchers' attention [36]. Natural antimicrobial peptides in oral cavities are the first line of defence against oral pathogenic microbes, such as *Streptococcus mutans* and *Candida albicans* [139,140]. Due to their promising antimicrobial abilities and low likelihood of inducing resistance, an increasing number of synthetic artificial antimicrobial peptides have been introduced [136]. Artificial antimicrobial peptides can be developed by modelling natural antimicrobial peptides, new designs and functional modifications. For example, KR12-KAKE is a novel antimicrobial peptide derived from LL37, which can inhibit the growth of *Streptococcus mutans* biofilm [141]. GH12, a newly designed antimicrobial peptide, shows antimicrobial activity against cariogenic pathogens and biofilms in vitro [142]. In addition, the peptide C16G2, modified from the broad-spectrum antimicrobial peptide G2, specifically targets *Streptococcus mutans* [143].

6.2. Mineralising Peptides

Peptides with mineralising effects, such as self-assembling peptides, have been proven in vitro as an effective strategy for treating initial caries [37]. For example, P_{11-4} is a selfassembling peptide which can form a 3D scaffold in carious lesions and promote the new formation of hydroxyapatite crystal, in what is called guided enamel regeneration [144]. Cao et al. developed a novel oligopeptide by fusing the hydrophilic C-terminal of amelo-

6.3. Peptides with Mineralising and Antimicrobial Properties

Researchers are also developing peptides with mineralising and antimicrobial properties targeted at caries management. Niu et al. developed a novel peptide, GA-KR12, which has broad-spectrum antimicrobial properties against cariogenic bacteria and *Candida albicans* [38]. This peptide can also remineralise initial enamel and dentine caries [146,147]. Wang et al. developed a peptide that can inhibit *Streptococcus mutans* and induce remineralisation [148]. Although many studies have focused on applying peptide-based materials for caries management, these materials are still in the early stages of laboratory studies [149]. Researchers should focus on promoting the translation to clinical use of peptides for caries management.

7. Prospect of Bioactive Materials for Caries Management

Because dental caries is a prevalent oral disease and bioactive materials have desirable remineralising properties, researchers are interested in developing novel bioactive materials for caries management. Table 2 shows the commercialisation status of bioactive materials mentioned in this paper.

Bioactive Materials	Commercial Product, Brand	Use	
Fluoride-based materials			
Acidulated fluorophosphate	Gelato APF Gel, Keystone Industries	In-office	
Silver diamine fluoride	38% SDF, Advantage Arrest	In-office	
Sodium fluoride	Duraphat Varnish, Colgate	In-office	
Amine fluoride	Active Remineralization Toothpaste, Amflor	At-home	
Sodium monofluorophosphate	Anticavity Toothpaste, Colgate	At-home	
Stannous fluoride	PerioMed Oral Rinse, 3M	At-home	
Calcium- and phosphate-based materials			
Calcium sodium phosphosilicate	NovaMin toothpaste, Sensodyne	At-home	
Casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate	Tooth Mousse, GC Europe	At-home	
Casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium fluoride	Tooth Mousse Plus, GC Europe	At-home	
phosphate	*	At-nome	
Functionalised tricalcium phosphate	Clinpro™ 5000 Toothpaste, 3M	At-home	
Nano-hydroxyapatite	Pro-Mineralizer Toothpaste, Great Oral Health	At-home	
Graphene-based materials			
Graphene	No Commercial product available	-	
Graphene oxide and reduced graphene oxide	No Commercial product available	-	
Metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials			
Silver nanoparticles	No Commercial product available	-	
Zinc oxide nanoparticles	No Commercial product available	-	
Copper nanoparticles	No Commercial product available	-	
Peptide-based materials			
Mineralising peptides	Curodont Repair, Straumann	In-office	
Antimicrobial peptides	No Commercial product available	-	
Mineralising antimicrobial peptides	No Commercial product available	-	

Table 2. Some commercial products of bioactive materials.

Some of the synthesised bioactive materials including fluoride-based materials, calciumand phosphate-based materials and peptide-based materials have been commercially produced. Topical fluoride products such as toothpastes, fluoride gels, fluoride rinse and fluoride varnishes can be used at-home or in-office [150]. Calcium- and phosphate-based materials are used as at-home dental care products. At present, only one peptide-based material is commercially available has for clinical use. Although researchers developed a variety of bioactive materials with promising remineralising properties, some of the materials are not yet commercialised. The researchers demonstrated that graphene-based materials, metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials and peptide-based materials are effective to remineralising demineralised lesions [32,33,36,38,151,152]. They are, however, mostly laboratory studies. Only a few are pre-clinical trials, and hence, the clinical evidence is not strong. Basic research is the foundation of translational research [153,154]. In the near future, there will be translation research to promote the application of novel bioactive materials for caries management. Conventional caries management is a surgical approach to replace the carious tissue with restoration [11]. More and more clinicians are now managing dental caries using minimal invasive approach and medical model [69].

8. Conclusions

In conclusion, studies have demonstrated that bioactive materials, including fluoridebased materials, calcium- and phosphate-based materials, graphene-based materials, metal and metal-oxide nanomaterials and peptide-based materials, possess ideal antimicrobial and remineralising properties for managing dental caries; however, the clinical evidence is still insufficient. Therefore, further research, accordingly, is essential to promote the clinical application of novel bioactive materials for caries management.

Author Contributions: Conceptualisation, O.L.Z.; methodology, O.L.Z. and O.Y.Y.; formal analysis, O.L.Z. and J.Y.N.; investigation, O.L.Z. and J.Y.N.; writing—original draft preparation, O.L.Z.; writing—review and editing, I.X.Y. and C.H.C.; supervision, O.Y.Y., M.L.M. and C.H.C.; project administration, C.H.C. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research is supported by the HKU Seed Fund for Basic Research #202111159098.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Not applicable.

Data Availability Statement: Data is contained within the article.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

7.

- Chen, J.; Duangthip, D.; Gao, S.S.; Huang, F.; Anthonappa, R.; Oliveira, B.H.; Turton, B.; Durward, C.; El Tantawi, M.; Attia, D.; et al. Oral Health Policies to Tackle the Burden of Early Childhood Caries: A Review of 14 Countries/Regions. *Front. Oral Health* 2021, 2, 670154. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Kassebaum, N.J.; Bernabe, E.; Dahiya, M.; Bhandari, B.; Murray, C.J.; Marcenes, W. Global burden of untreated caries: A systematic review and metaregression. J. Dent. Res. 2015, 94, 650–658. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 3. Wen, P.Y.F.; Chen, M.X.; Zhong, Y.J.; Dong, Q.Q.; Wong, H.M. Global Burden and Inequality of Dental Caries, 1990 to 2019. *J. Dent. Res.* 2022, 101, 392–399. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Demir, P.; Aydogdu, H.; Sar, I.S. Knowledge, Attitude and Clinical Practice of Dentists about Extraction of First Permanent Molars. J. Clin. Pediatr. Dent. 2022, 46, 12–19. [CrossRef]
- 5. Vergnes, J.N.; Mazevet, M. Oral diseases: A global public health challenge. Lancet 2020, 395, 186. [CrossRef]
- Peres, M.A.; Macpherson, L.M.D.; Weyant, R.J.; Daly, B.; Venturelli, R.; Mathur, M.R.; Listl, S.; Celeste, R.K.; Guarnizo-Herreno, C.C.; Kearns, C.; et al. Oral diseases: A global public health challenge. *Lancet* 2019, 394, 249–260. [CrossRef]
 - Tsang, P.; Qi, F.; Shi, W. Medical approach to dental caries: Fight the disease, not the lesion. *Pediatr. Dent.* 2006, 28, 188–191.
- Federation, F.D.I.W.D. FDI policy statement on Minimal Intervention Dentistry (MID) for managing dental caries: Adopted by the General Assembly: September 2016, Poznan, Poland. Int. Dent. J. 2017, 67, 6–7. [CrossRef]
- Machiulskiene, V.; Campus, G.; Carvalho, J.C.; Dige, I.; Ekstrand, K.R.; Jablonski-Momeni, A.; Maltz, M.; Manton, D.J.; Martignon, S.; Martinez-Mier, E.A.; et al. Terminology of Dental Caries and Dental Caries Management: Consensus Report of a Workshop Organized by ORCA and Cariology Research Group of IADR. *Caries Res.* 2020, 54, 7–14. [CrossRef]
- 10. Cheng, L.; Zhang, L.; Yue, L.; Ling, J.; Fan, M.; Yang, D.; Huang, Z.; Niu, Y.; Liu, J.; Zhao, J.; et al. Expert consensus on dental caries management. *Int. J. Oral Sci.* 2022, *14*, 17. [CrossRef]
- 11. Yon, M.J.Y.; Gao, S.S.; Chen, K.J.; Duangthip, D.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Medical Model in Caries Management. *Dent. J.* **2019**, *7*, 37. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 12. Simon, L.S.; Dash, J.K.; U, D.; Philip, S.; Sarangi, S. Management of Post Orthodontic White Spot Lesions Using Resin Infiltration and CPP-ACP Materials- A Clinical Study. J. Clin. Pediatr. Dent. 2022, 46, 70–74. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Butera, A.; Pascadopoli, M.; Pellegrini, M.; Trapani, B.; Gallo, S.; Radu, M.; Scribante, A. Biomimetic hydroxyapatite paste for molar-incisor hypomineralization: A randomized clinical trial. *Oral Dis.* 2022. *Epub ahead of print*. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 14. Melo, M.A.; Mei, M.L.; Li, K.C.; Hamama, H.H. Editorial: The Use of Bioactive Materials in Caries Management. *Front. Oral Health* **2022**, *3*, 832285. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 15. Williams, D.F. On the nature of biomaterials. Biomaterials 2009, 30, 5897–5909. [CrossRef]
- 16. Darvell, B.W.; Smith, A.J. Inert to bioactive—A multidimensional spectrum. Dent. Mater. 2022, 38, 2–6. [CrossRef]
- 17. Jefferies, S.R. Bioactive and biomimetic restorative materials: A comprehensive review. Part I. J. Esthet. Restor. Dent. 2014, 26, 14–26. [CrossRef]
- 18. Flemming, H.C.; Wingender, J.; Szewzyk, U.; Steinberg, P.; Rice, S.A.; Kjelleberg, S. Biofilms: An emergent form of bacterial life. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* **2016**, *14*, 563–575. [CrossRef]
- Stoodley, P.; Sauer, K.; Davies, D.G.; Costerton, J.W. Biofilms as complex differentiated communities. *Annu. Rev. Microbiol.* 2002, 56, 187–209. [CrossRef]
- Xu, V.W.; Nizami, M.Z.I.; Yin, I.X.; Lung, C.Y.K.; Yu, O.Y.; Chu, C.H. Caries Management with Non-Metallic Nanomaterials: A Systematic Review. Int. J. Nanomed. 2022, 17, 5809–5824. [CrossRef]
- Pfarrer, A.M.; Karlinsey, R.L. Challenges of implementing new remineralization technologies. *Adv. Dent. Res.* 2009, 21, 79–82. [CrossRef]
- 22. Gao, S.S.; Zhang, S.; Mei, M.L.; Lo, E.C.; Chu, C.H. Caries remineralisation and arresting effect in children by professionally applied fluoride treatment—A systematic review. *BMC Oral Health* **2016**, *16*, *12*. [CrossRef]
- Saporito, R.A.; Boneta, A.R.; Feldman, C.A.; Cinotti, W.; Sintes, J.L.; Stewart, B.; Volpe, A.R.; Proskin, H.M. Comparative anticaries efficacy of sodium fluoride and sodium monofluorophosphate dentifrices. A two-year caries clinical trial on children in New Jersey and Puerto Rico. Am. J. Dent. 2000, 13, 221–226.
- 24. Goldenfum, G.M.; Silva, N.C.; Almeida, I.D.A.; Neves, M.; Silva, B.B.E.; Jardim, J.J.; Rodrigues, J.A. Efficacy of 1.23% acidulated phosphate fluoride gel on non-cavitated enamel lesions: A randomized clinical trial. *Braz. Oral Res.* 2021, 35, e038. [CrossRef]
- 25. Rugg-Gunn, A.; Banoczy, J. Fluoride toothpastes and fluoride mouthrinses for home use. *Acta Med. Acad.* **2013**, *42*, 168–178. [CrossRef]
- 26. Madlena, M. Experiences with amine fluoride containing products in the management of dental hard tissue lesions focusing on Hungarian studies: A review. *Acta Med. Acad.* **2013**, *42*, 189–197. [CrossRef]
- 27. Somasundaram, P.; Vimala, N.; Mandke, L.G. Protective potential of casein phosphopeptide amorphous calcium phosphate containing paste on enamel surfaces. *J. Conserv. Dent.* 2013, *16*, 152–156. [CrossRef]
- Reynolds, E.C.; Cai, F.; Cochrane, N.J.; Shen, P.; Walker, G.D.; Morgan, M.V.; Reynolds, C. Fluoride and casein phosphopeptideamorphous calcium phosphate. J. Dent. Res. 2008, 87, 344–348. [CrossRef]
- 29. Karlinsey, R.L.; Mackey, A.C. Solid-state preparation and dental application of an organically modified calcium phosphate. *J. Mater. Sci.* 2009, 44, 346–349. [CrossRef]
- Rajendran, R.; Hussain, M.S.; Sandhya, R.; Thomas, A.J.; Ameena, M.; Saleem, S. Comparative evaluation of remineralisation potential of bioactive glass, casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate and novel strontium-doped nanohydroxyapatite paste: An In-Vitro study. *Indian J. Dent. Res.* 2022, 33, 94–99. [CrossRef]
- Rahaman, M.N.; Day, D.E.; Bal, B.S.; Fu, Q.; Jung, S.B.; Bonewald, L.F.; Tomsia, A.P. Bioactive glass in tissue engineering. *Acta Biomater.* 2011, 7, 2355–2373. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 32. Nizami, M.Z.I.; Yin, I.X.; Lung, C.Y.K.; Niu, J.Y.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. In Vitro Studies of Graphene for Management of Dental Caries and Periodontal Disease: A Concise Review. *Pharmaceutics* **2022**, *14*, 1997. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Yin, I.X.; Zhao, I.S.; Mei, M.L.; Li, Q.L.; Yu, O.Y.; Chu, C.H. Use of Silver Nanomaterials for Caries Prevention: A Concise Review. Int. J. Nanomed. 2020, 15, 3181–3191. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 34. Nizami, M.Z.I.; Xu, V.W.; Yin, I.X.; Yu, O.Y.; Chu, C.H. Metal and Metal Oxide Nanoparticles in Caries Prevention: A Review. *Nanomaterials* **2021**, *11*, 3446. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 35. Xu, V.W.; Nizami, M.Z.I.; Yin, I.X.; Yu, O.Y.; Lung, C.Y.K.; Chu, C.H. Application of Copper Nanoparticles in Dentistry. *Nanomaterials* **2022**, *12*, 805. [CrossRef]
- Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Wu, W.K.K.; Li, Q.L.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. Antimicrobial peptides for the prevention and treatment of dental caries: A concise review. Arch. Oral Biol. 2021, 122, 105022. [CrossRef]
- Alkilzy, M.; Santamaria, R.M.; Schmoeckel, J.; Splieth, C.H. Treatment of Carious Lesions Using Self-Assembling Peptides. Adv. Dent. Res. 2018, 29, 42–47. [CrossRef]
- Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Wu, W.K.K.; Li, Q.L.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. A novel dual-action antimicrobial peptide for caries management. J. Dent. 2021, 111, 103729. [CrossRef]
- 39. Mei, M.L.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Arresting Dentine Caries with Silver Diamine Fluoride: What's Behind It? *J. Dent. Res.* 2018, 97, 751–758. [CrossRef]
- 40. Gao, S.S.; Chen, K.J.; Duangthip, D.; Wong, M.C.M.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Arresting early childhood caries using silver and fluoride products—A randomised trial. *J. Dent.* **2020**, *103*, 103522. [CrossRef]
- 41. Chu, C.H.; Mei, M.L.; Lo, E.C. Use of fluorides in dental caries management. Gen. Dent. 2010, 58, 37-43.
- 42. Petersen, P.E. World Health Organization global policy for improvement of oral health—World Health Assembly 2007. *Int. Dent. J.* **2008**, *58*, 115–121. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- Iheozor-Ejiofor, Z.; Worthington, H.V.; Walsh, T.; O'Malley, L.; Clarkson, J.E.; Macey, R.; Alam, R.; Tugwell, P.; Welch, V.; Glenny, A.M. Water fluoridation for the prevention of dental caries. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev.* 2015, 2015, CD010856. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H.; Low, K.H.; Che, C.M.; Lo, E.C. Caries arresting effect of silver diamine fluoride on dentine carious lesion with S. mutans and L. acidophilus dual-species cariogenic biofilm. *Med. Oral Patol. Oral Cir. Bucal.* 2013, 18, e824–e831. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 45. Newbrun, E. Topical fluorides in caries prevention and management: A North American perspective. *J. Dent. Educ* 2001, 65, 1078–1083. [CrossRef]
- 46. O'Mullane, D.M.; Baez, R.J.; Jones, S.; Lennon, M.A.; Petersen, P.E.; Rugg-Gunn, A.J.; Whelton, H.; Whitford, G.M. Fluoride and Oral Health. *Community Dent. Health* **2016**, *33*, 69–99.
- 47. Zheng, F.M.; Yan, I.G.; Duangthip, D.; Gao, S.S.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Silver diamine fluoride therapy for dental care. *Jpn. Dent. Sci. Rev.* 2022, *58*, 249–257. [CrossRef]
- Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H.; Lo, E.C.; Samaranayake, L.P. Fluoride and silver concentrations of silver diammine fluoride solutions for dental use. *Int. J. Paediatr. Dent.* 2013, 23, 279–285. [CrossRef]
- Yee, R.; Holmgren, C.; Mulder, J.; Lama, D.; Walker, D.; van Palenstein Helderman, W. Efficacy of silver diamine fluoride for Arresting Caries Treatment. J. Dent. Res. 2009, 88, 644–647. [CrossRef]
- 50. Fung, M.H.T.; Duangthip, D.; Wong, M.C.M.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Randomized Clinical Trial of 12% and 38% Silver Diamine Fluoride Treatment. *J. Dent. Res.* 2018, *97*, 171–178. [CrossRef]
- 51. Gao, S.S.; Zhao, I.S.; Hiraishi, N.; Duangthip, D.; Mei, M.L.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Clinical Trials of Silver Diamine Fluoride in Arresting Caries among Children: A Systematic Review. *JDR Clin. Trans. Res.* **2016**, *1*, 201–210. [CrossRef]
- Wong, M.C.; Lam, K.F.; Lo, E.C. Analysis of multilevel grouped survival data with time-varying regression coefficients. *Stat. Med.* 2011, 30, 250–259. [CrossRef]
- Gold, J. Silver Diamine Fluoride May Prevent and Arrest Root Caries in Older Adults. J. Evid. Based Dent. Pract. 2019, 19, 186–188. [CrossRef]
- Chai, H.H.; Kiuchi, S.; Osaka, K.; Aida, J.; Chu, C.H.; Gao, S.S. Knowledge, Practices and Attitudes towards Silver Diamine Fluoride Therapy among Dentists in Japan: A Mixed Methods Study. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2022, 19, 8705. [CrossRef]
- 55. Horst, J.A.; Ellenikiotis, H.; Milgrom, P.L. UCSF Protocol for Caries Arrest Using Silver Diamine Fluoride: Rationale, Indications and Consent. J. Calif. Dent. Assoc. 2016, 44, 16–28.
- 56. Chu, C.H.; Lo, E.C. Promoting caries arrest in children with silver diamine fluoride: A review. *Oral Health Prev. Dent.* **2008**, *6*, 315–321.
- 57. Duangthip, D.; Fung, M.H.T.; Wong, M.C.M.; Chu, C.H.; Lo, E.C.M. Adverse Effects of Silver Diamine Fluoride Treatment among Preschool Children. *J. Dent. Res.* 2018, *97*, 395–401. [CrossRef]
- 58. Seppa, L. Fluoride varnishes in caries prevention. Med. Princ. Pract. 2004, 13, 307–311. [CrossRef]
- 59. Chen, K.J.; Gao, S.S.; Duangthip, D.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Managing Early Childhood Caries for Young Children in China. *Healthcare* **2018**, *6*, 11. [CrossRef]
- 60. American Dental Association Council on Scientific, A. Professionally applied topical fluoride: Evidence-based clinical recommendations. J. Dent. Educ. 2007, 71, 393–402. [CrossRef]
- 61. Mascarenhas, A.K. Is fluoride varnish safe?: Validating the safety of fluoride varnish. *J. Am. Dent. Assoc.* **2021**, 152, 364–368. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 62. Marinho, V.C.; Worthington, H.V.; Walsh, T.; Clarkson, J.E. Fluoride varnishes for preventing dental caries in children and adolescents. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev.* 2013, 7, CD002279. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 63. Manchanda, S.; Sardana, D.; Liu, P.; Lee, G.H.; Li, K.Y.; Lo, E.C.; Yiu, C.K. Topical fluoride to prevent early childhood caries: Systematic review with network meta-analysis. *J. Dent.* **2022**, *116*, 103885. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 64. Chu, C.H.; Lo, E.C.; Lin, H.C. Effectiveness of silver diamine fluoride and sodium fluoride varnish in arresting dentin caries in Chinese pre-school children. *J. Dent. Res.* **2002**, *81*, 767–770. [CrossRef]
- 65. Makin, S.A. Stannous fluoride dentifrices. Am. J. Dent. 2013, 26, 3A–9A.
- 66. Valkenburg, C.; Slot, D.E.; Van der Weijden, G. What is the effect of active ingredients in dentifrice on inhibiting the regrowth of overnight plaque? A systematic review. *Int. J. Dent. Hyg.* **2020**, *18*, 128–141. [CrossRef]
- Naumova, E.A.; Staiger, M.; Kouji, O.; Modric, J.; Pierchalla, T.; Rybka, M.; Hill, R.G.; Arnold, W.H. Randomized investigation of the bioavailability of fluoride in saliva after administration of sodium fluoride, amine fluoride and fluoride containing bioactive glass dentifrices. *BMC Oral Health* 2019, 19, 119. [CrossRef]
- 68. Cochrane, N.J.; Cai, F.; Huq, N.L.; Burrow, M.F.; Reynolds, E.C. New approaches to enhanced remineralization of tooth enamel. *J. Dent. Res.* **2010**, *89*, 1187–1197. [CrossRef]
- 69. Yu, O.Y.; Lam, W.Y.; Wong, A.W.; Duangthip, D.; Chu, C.H. Nonrestorative Management of Dental Caries. *Dent. J.* **2021**, *9*, 121. [CrossRef]
- Gonzalez-Cabezas, C.; Fernandez, C.E. Recent Advances in Remineralization Therapies for Caries Lesions. Adv. Dent. Res. 2018, 29, 55–59. [CrossRef]
- Cross, K.J.; Huq, N.L.; Reynolds, E.C. Casein Phosphopeptide-Amorphous Calcium Phosphate Nanocomplexes: A Structural Model. *Biochemistry* 2016, 55, 4316–4325. [CrossRef]

- Morgan, M.V.; Adams, G.G.; Bailey, D.L.; Tsao, C.E.; Fischman, S.L.; Reynolds, E.C. The anticariogenic effect of sugar-free gum containing CPP-ACP nanocomplexes on approximal caries determined using digital bitewing radiography. *Caries Res.* 2008, 42, 171–184. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Yengopal, V.; Mickenautsch, S. Caries preventive effect of casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate (CPP-ACP): A meta-analysis. *Acta Odontol. Scand.* 2009, 67, 321–332. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Cochrane, N.J.; Reynolds, E.C. Calcium phosphopeptides mechanisms of action and evidence for clinical efficacy. *Adv. Dent. Res.* 2012, 24, 41–47. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 75. Philip, N.; Walsh, L. The potential ecological effects of casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate in dental caries prevention. *Aust. Dent. J* 2019, *64*, 66–71. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 76. Al-Batayneh, O.B.; Al-Rai, S.A.; Khader, Y.S. Effect of CPP-ACP on *Streptococcus mutans* in saliva of high caries-risk preschool children: A randomized clinical trial. *Eur. Arch. Paediatr. Dent.* **2020**, *21*, 339–346. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Plonka, K.A.; Pukallus, M.L.; Holcombe, T.F.; Barnett, A.G.; Walsh, L.J.; Seow, W.K. Randomized controlled trial: A randomized controlled clinical trial comparing a remineralizing paste with an antibacterial gel to prevent early childhood caries. *Pediatr. Dent.* 2013, *35*, 8–12.
- Pukallus, M.L.; Plonka, K.A.; Holcombe, T.F.; Barnett, A.G.; Walsh, L.J.; Seow, W.K. A randomized controlled trial of a 10 percent CPP-ACP cream to reduce mutans streptococci colonization. *Pediatr. Dent.* 2013, 35, 550–555.
- Li, J.; Xie, X.; Wang, Y.; Yin, W.; Antoun, J.S.; Farella, M.; Mei, L. Long-term remineralizing effect of casein phosphopeptideamorphous calcium phosphate (CPP-ACP) on early caries lesions in vivo: A systematic review. J. Dent. 2014, 42, 769–777. [CrossRef]
- 80. Bijle, M.N.A.; Yiu, C.K.Y.; Ekambaram, M. Calcium-Based Caries Preventive Agents: A Meta-evaluation of Systematic Reviews and Meta-analysis. J. Evid. Based Dent. Pract. 2018, 18, 203–217. [CrossRef]
- 81. Cochrane, N.J.; Saranathan, S.; Cai, F.; Cross, K.J.; Reynolds, E.C. Enamel subsurface lesion remineralisation with casein phosphopeptide stabilised solutions of calcium, phosphate and fluoride. *Caries Res.* **2008**, *42*, 88–97. [CrossRef]
- Thierens, L.A.M.; Moerman, S.; Elst, C.V.; Vercruysse, C.; Maes, P.; Temmerman, L.; Roo, N.M.C.; Verbeeck, R.M.H.; Pauw, G.A.M. The in vitro remineralizing effect of CPP-ACP and CPP-ACPF after 6 and 12 weeks on initial caries lesion. *J. Appl. Oral Sci.* 2019, 27, e20180589. [CrossRef]
- 83. Raphael, S.; Blinkhorn, A. Is there a place for Tooth Mousse in the prevention and treatment of early dental caries? A systematic review. *BMC Oral Health* **2015**, *15*, 113. [CrossRef]
- 84. Karlinsey, R.L.; Pfarrer, A.M. Fluoride plus functionalized beta-TCP: A promising combination for robust remineralization. *Adv. Dent. Res.* **2012**, *24*, 48–52. [CrossRef]
- Bhadoria, N.; Gunwal, M.K.; Kukreja, R.; Maran, S.; Devendrappa, S.N.; Singla, S. An In Vitro Evaluation of Remineralization Potential of Functionalized Tricalcium Phosphate Paste and CPP-ACPF on Artificial White Spot Lesion in Primary and Permanent Enamel. *Int. J. Clin. Pediatr. Dent.* 2020, 13, 579–584. [CrossRef]
- 86. Habibah, T.U.; Amlani, D.V.; Brizuela, M. Hydroxyapatite Dental Material. In *StatPearls*; StatPearls Publishing: Treasure Island, FL, USA, 2022. Available online: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK513314/ (accessed on 21 December 2022).
- 87. Abdul Halim, N.A.; Hussein, M.Z.; Kandar, M.K. Nanomaterials-Upconverted Hydroxyapatite for Bone Tissue Engineering and a Platform for Drug Delivery. *Int. J. Nanomed.* **2021**, *16*, 6477–6496. [CrossRef]
- 88. Najibfard, K.; Ramalingam, K.; Chedjieu, I.; Amaechi, B.T. Remineralization of early caries by a nano-hydroxyapatite dentifrice. *J. Clin. Dent.* **2011**, *22*, 139–143.
- 89. Huang, S.; Gao, S.; Cheng, L.; Yu, H. Remineralization potential of nano-hydroxyapatite on initial enamel lesions: An in vitro study. *Caries Res.* 2011, 45, 460–468. [CrossRef]
- Juntavee, A.; Juntavee, N.; Sinagpulo, A.N. Nano-Hydroxyapatite Gel and Its Effects on Remineralization of Artificial Carious Lesions. Int. J. Dent. 2021, 2021, 7256056. [CrossRef]
- Geeta, R.D.; Vallabhaneni, S.; Fatima, K. Comparative evaluation of remineralization potential of nanohydroxyapatite crystals, bioactive glass, casein phosphopeptide-amorphous calcium phosphate, and fluoride on initial enamel lesion (scanning electron microscope analysis)—An in vitro study. J. Conserv. Dent. 2020, 23, 275–279. [CrossRef]
- Juntavee, A.; Juntavee, N.; Hirunmoon, P. Remineralization Potential of Nanohydroxyapatite Toothpaste Compared with Tricalcium Phosphate and Fluoride Toothpaste on Artificial Carious Lesions. *Int. J. Dent.* 2021, 2021, 5588832. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 93. Manchery, N.; John, J.; Nagappan, N.; Subbiah, G.K.; Premnath, P. Remineralization potential of dentifrice containing nanohydroxyapatite on artificial carious lesions of enamel: A comparative in vitro study. *Dent. Res. J.* **2019**, *16*, 310–317. [CrossRef]
- Anil, A.; Ibraheem, W.I.; Meshni, A.A.; Preethanath, R.S.; Anil, S. Nano-Hydroxyapatite (nHAp) in the Remineralization of Early Dental Caries: A Scoping Review. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2022, 19, 5629. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Dai, L.L.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H.; Lo, E.C.M. Mechanisms of Bioactive Glass on Caries Management: A Review. Materials 2019, 12, 4183. [CrossRef]
- Burwell, A.K.; Litkowski, L.J.; Greenspan, D.C. Calcium Sodium Phosphosilicate (NovaMin[®]): Remineralization Potential. *Adv. Dent. Res.* 2009, 21, 35–39. [CrossRef]
- 97. Wang, Y.; Mei, L.; Gong, L.; Li, J.; He, S.; Ji, Y.; Sun, W. Remineralization of early enamel caries lesions using different bioactive elements containing toothpastes: An in vitro study. *Technol. Health Care* **2016**, *24*, 701–711. [CrossRef]

- Hsu, S.M.; Alsafadi, M.; Vasconez, C.; Fares, C.; Craciun, V.; O'Neill, E.; Ren, F.; Clark, A.; Esquivel-Upshaw, J. Qualitative Analysis of Remineralization Capabilities of Bioactive Glass (NovaMin) and Fluoride on Hydroxyapatite (HA) Discs: An In Vitro Study. *Materials* 2021, 14, 3813. [CrossRef]
- 99. Wu, Q.; Mei, M.L.; Wu, X.; Shi, S.Y.; Xu, Y.T.; Chu, C.H.; Chen, Y.M. Remineralising effect of 45S5 bioactive glass on artificial caries in dentine. *BMC Oral Health* 2020, 20, 49. [CrossRef]
- Zhou, P.; Garcia, B.L.; Kotsakis, G.A. Comparison of antibacterial and antibiofilm activity of bioactive glass compounds S53P4 and 45S5. *BMC Microbiol.* 2022, 22, 212. [CrossRef]
- 101. Taha, A.A.; Patel, M.P.; Hill, R.G.; Fleming, P.S. The effect of bioactive glasses on enamel remineralization: A systematic review. *J. Dent.* 2017, 67, 9–17. [CrossRef]
- 102. Ionescu, A.C.; Degli Esposti, L.; Iafisco, M.; Brambilla, E. Dental tissue remineralization by bioactive calcium phosphate nanoparticles formulations. *Sci. Rep.* 2022, *12*, 5994. [CrossRef]
- Fontana, M. Enhancing Fluoride: Clinical Human Studies of Alternatives or Boosters for Caries Management. *Caries Res.* 2016, 50, 22–37. [CrossRef]
- 104. Soares, R.; De Ataide, I.N.; Fernandes, M.; Lambor, R. Assessment of Enamel Remineralisation After Treatment with Four Different Remineralising Agents: A Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM) Study. J. Clin. Diagn. Res. 2017, 11, ZC136–ZC141. [CrossRef]
- 105. Liu, C.C.; Tan, D.; Chen, X.L.; Liao, J.F.; Wu, L. Research on Graphene and Its Derivatives in Oral Disease Treatment. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* **2022**, *23*, 4737. [CrossRef]
- 106. Tahriri, M.; Del Monico, M.; Moghanian, A.; Tavakkoli Yaraki, M.; Torres, R.; Yadegari, A.; Tayebi, L. Graphene and its derivatives: Opportunities and challenges in dentistry. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C Mater. Biol. Appl.* 2019, 102, 171–185. [CrossRef]
- 107. He, J.L.; Zhu, X.D.; Qi, Z.N.; Wang, C.; Mao, X.J.; Zhu, C.L.; He, Z.Y.; Lo, M.Y.; Tang, Z.S. Killing Dental Pathogens Using Antibacterial Graphene Oxide. ACS Appl. Mater. Inter. 2015, 7, 5605–5611. [CrossRef]
- Nizami, M.Z.I.; Nishina, Y.; Yamamoto, T.; Shinoda-Ito, Y.; Takashiba, S. Functionalized Graphene Oxide Shields Tooth Dentin from Decalcification. J. Dent. Res. 2020, 99, 182–188. [CrossRef]
- 109. Wang, Y.; Li, Z.H.; Wang, J.; Li, J.H.; Lin, Y.H. Graphene and graphene oxide: Biofunctionalization and applications in biotechnology. *Trends Biotechnol.* **2011**, *29*, 205–212. [CrossRef]
- 110. Smith, A.T.; LaChance, A.M.; Zeng, S.; Liu, B.; Sun, L. Synthesis, properties, and applications of graphene oxide/reduced graphene oxide and their nanocomposites. *Nano Mater. Sci.* **2019**, *1*, 31–47. [CrossRef]
- 111. Wu, S.Z.; Liu, Y.J.; Zhang, H.; Lei, L. Nano-graphene oxide with antisense vicR RNA reduced exopolysaccharide synthesis and biofilm aggregation for *Streptococcus mutans*. *Dent. Mater. J.* **2020**, *39*, 278–286. [CrossRef]
- 112. Khosalim, I.P.; Zhang, Y.Y.; Yiu, C.K.Y.; Wong, H.M. Electrophoresis-Aided Biomimetic Mineralization System Using Graphene Oxide for Regeneration of Hydroxyapatite on Dentin. *Materials* **2021**, *15*, 199. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 113. Zanni, E.; Chandraiahgari, C.R.; De Bellis, G.; Montereali, M.R.; Armiento, G.; Ballirano, P.; Polimeni, A.; Sarto, M.S.; Uccelletti, D. Zinc Oxide Nanorods-Decorated Graphene Nanoplatelets: A Promising Antimicrobial Agent against the Cariogenic Bacterium Streptococcus mutans. Nanomaterials 2016, 6, 179. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Mao, M.Y.; Zhang, W.J.; Huang, Z.W.; Huang, J.; Wang, J.; Li, W.P.; Gu, S.S. Graphene Oxide-Copper Nanocomposites Suppress Cariogenic Streptococcus mutans Biofilm Formation. Int. J. Nanomed 2021, 16, 7727–7739. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 115. Yin, I.X.; Zhao, I.S.; Mei, M.L.; Lo, E.C.M.; Tang, J.; Li, Q.; So, L.Y.; Chu, C.H. Synthesis and Characterization of Fluoridated Silver Nanoparticles and Their Potential as a Non-Staining Anti-Caries Agent. *Int. J. Nanomed.* 2020, 15, 3207–3215. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 116. Cheng, L.; Zhang, K.; Weir, M.D.; Melo, M.A.; Zhou, X.; Xu, H.H. Nanotechnology strategies for antibacterial and remineralizing composites and adhesives to tackle dental caries. *Nanomedicine* **2015**, *10*, 627–641. [CrossRef]
- Yin, I.X.; Zhang, J.; Zhao, I.S.; Mei, M.L.; Li, Q.; Chu, C.H. The Antibacterial Mechanism of Silver Nanoparticles and Its Application in Dentistry. Int. J. Nanomed. 2020, 15, 2555–2562. [CrossRef]
- 118. Giron, C.B.T.; Sierra, J.H.F.; DeAlba-Montero, I.; Pena, M.D.U.; Ruiz, F. Therapeutic Use of Silver Nanoparticles in the Prevention and Arrest of Dental Caries. *Bioinorg. Chem. Appl.* 2020, 2020, 8882930. [CrossRef]
- 119. Zhao, I.S.; Yin, I.X.; Mei, M.L.; Lo, E.C.M.; Tang, J.; Li, Q.; So, L.Y.; Chu, C.H. Remineralising Dentine Caries Using Sodium Fluoride with Silver Nanoparticles: An In Vitro Study. *Int. J. Nanomed.* **2020**, *15*, 2829–2839. [CrossRef]
- 120. Yin, I.X.; Yu, O.Y.; Zhao, I.S.; Mei, M.L.; Li, Q.L.; Tang, J.; Lo, E.C.M.; Chu, C.H. Inhibition of dentine caries using fluoride solution with silver nanoparticles: An in vitro study. *J. Dent.* **2020**, *103*, 103512. [CrossRef]
- 121. Nozari, A.; Ajami, S.; Rafiei, A.; Niazi, E. Impact of Nano Hydroxyapatite, Nano Silver Fluoride and Sodium Fluoride Varnish on Primary Teeth Enamel Remineralization: An In Vitro Study. J. Clin. Diagn. Res. 2017, 11, ZC97–ZC100. [CrossRef]
- 122. Teixeira, J.A.; Silva, A.; Dos Santos Junior, V.E.; de Melo Junior, P.C.; Arnaud, M.; Lima, M.G.; Flores, M.A.P.; Stamford, T.C.M.; Dias Pereira, J.R.; Ribeiro Targino, A.G.; et al. Effects of a New Nano-Silver Fluoride-Containing Dentifrice on Demineralization of Enamel and *Streptococcus mutans* Adhesion and Acidogenicity. *Int. J. Dent.* 2018, 2018, 1351925. [CrossRef]
- Favaro, J.C.; Detomini, T.R.; Maia, L.P.; Poli, R.C.; Guiraldo, R.D.; Lopes, M.B.; Berger, S.B. Anticaries Agent Based on Silver Nanoparticles and Fluoride: Characterization and Biological and Remineralizing Effects-An In Vitro Study. *Int. J. Dent.* 2022, 2022, 9483589. [CrossRef]

- 124. dos Santos, V.E.; Vasconcelos, A.; Targino, A.G.R.; Flores, M.A.P.; Galembeck, A.; Caldas, A.F.; Rosenblatt, A. A New "Silver-Bullet" to treat caries in children—Nano Silver Fluoride: A randomised clinical trial. *J. Dent.* **2014**, *42*, 945–951. [CrossRef]
- 125. Tirupathi, S.; Svsg, N.; Rajasekhar, S.; Nuvvula, S. Comparative cariostatic efficacy of a novel Nano-silver fluoride varnish with 38% silver diamine fluoride varnish a double-blind randomized clinical trial. *J. Clin. Exp. Dent.* **2019**, *11*, e105–e112. [CrossRef]
- 126. Khubchandani, M.; Thosar, N.R.; Dangore-Khasbage, S.; Srivastava, R. Applications of Silver Nanoparticles in Pediatric Dentistry: An Overview. *Cureus* **2022**, *14*, e26956. [CrossRef]
- 127. Takamiya, A.S.; Monteiro, D.R.; Bernabe, D.G.; Gorup, L.F.; Camargo, E.R.; Gomes-Filho, J.E.; Oliveira, S.H.; Barbosa, D.B. In Vitro and In Vivo Toxicity Evaluation of Colloidal Silver Nanoparticles Used in Endodontic Treatments. J. Endod. 2016, 42, 953–960. [CrossRef]
- 128. Angel Villegas, N.; Silvero Compagnucci, M.J.; Sainz Aja, M.; Rocca, D.M.; Becerra, M.C.; Fabian Molina, G.; Palma, S.D. Novel Antibacterial Resin-Based Filling Material Containing Nanoparticles for the Potential One-Step Treatment of Caries. *J. Healthc. Eng.* 2019, 2019, 6367919. [CrossRef]
- 129. Gutierrez, M.F.; Bermudez, J.; Davila-Sanchez, A.; Alegria-Acevedo, L.F.; Mendez-Bauer, L.; Hernandez, M.; Astorga, J.; Reis, A.; Loguercio, A.D.; Farago, P.V.; et al. Zinc oxide and copper nanoparticles addition in universal adhesive systems improve interface stability on caries-affected dentin. *J. Mech. Behav. Biomed. Mater.* 2019, 100, 103366. [CrossRef]
- Kasraei, S.; Sami, L.; Hendi, S.; Alikhani, M.Y.; Rezaei-Soufi, L.; Khamverdi, Z. Antibacterial properties of composite resins incorporating silver and zinc oxide nanoparticles on *Streptococcus mutans* and *Lactobacillus*. *Restor. Dent. Endod.* 2014, 39, 109–114. [CrossRef]
- Swetha, D.L.; Vinay, C.; Uloopi, K.S.; RojaRamya, K.S.; Chandrasekhar, R. Antibacterial and Mechanical Properties of Pit and Fissure Sealants Containing Zinc Oxide and Calcium Fluoride Nanoparticles. *Contemp. Clin. Dent.* 2019, 10, 477–482. [CrossRef]
- 132. Amiri, M.; Etemadifar, Z.; Daneshkazemi, A.; Nateghi, M. Antimicrobial Effect of Copper Oxide Nanoparticles on Some Oral Bacteria and *Candida* Species. *J. Dent. Biomater.* **2017**, *4*, 347–352. [PubMed]
- Covarrubias, C.; Trepiana, D.; Corral, C. Synthesis of hybrid copper-chitosan nanoparticles with antibacterial activity against cariogenic *Streptococcus mutans*. *Dent. Mater. J.* 2018, 37, 379–384. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 134. Altankhishig, B.; Matsuda, Y.; Nagano-Takebe, F.; Okuyama, K.; Yamamoto, H.; Sakurai, M.; Naito, K.; Hayashi, M.; Sano, H.; Sidhu, S.K.; et al. Potential of Fluoride-Containing Zinc Oxide and Copper Oxide Nanocomposites on Dentin Bonding Ability. Nanomaterials 2022, 12, 1291. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Zhang, O.L.; Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Yu, O.Y.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. Growing Global Research Interest in Antimicrobial Peptides for Caries Management: A Bibliometric Analysis. J. Funct. Biomater. 2022, 13, 210. [CrossRef]
- 136. Niu, Y.; Yin, X.; Wu, W.K.K.; Li, Q.L.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. Data from: A concise review on antimicrobial peptides for prevention and treatment of dental caries. *Dryad* 2021. [CrossRef]
- 137. Kumar, P.; Kizhakkedathu, J.N.; Straus, S.K. Antimicrobial Peptides: Diversity, Mechanism of Action and Strategies to Improve the Activity and Biocompatibility In Vivo. *Biomolecules* **2018**, *8*, 4. [CrossRef]
- 138. Kurbasic, M.; Parisi, E.; Garcia, A.M.; Marchesan, S. Self-Assembling, Ultrashort Peptide Gels as Antimicrobial Biomaterials. *Curr. Top. Med. Chem.* **2020**, *20*, 1300–1309. [CrossRef]
- 139. Wang, G.; Narayana, J.L.; Mishra, B.; Zhang, Y.; Wang, F.; Wang, C.; Zarena, D.; Lushnikova, T.; Wang, X. Design of Antimicrobial Peptides: Progress Made with Human Cathelicidin LL-37. *Adv. Exp. Med. Biol.* **2019**, *1117*, 215–240. [CrossRef]
- 140. Mai, S.; Mauger, M.T.; Niu, L.N.; Barnes, J.B.; Kao, S.; Bergeron, B.E.; Ling, J.Q.; Tay, F.R. Potential applications of antimicrobial peptides and their mimics in combating caries and pulpal infections. *Acta Biomater.* **2017**, *49*, 16–35. [CrossRef]
- 141. da Silva, B.R.; Conrado, A.J.S.; Pereira, A.L.; Evaristo, F.F.V.; Arruda, F.V.S.; Vasconcelos, M.A.; Lorenzon, E.N.; Cilli, E.M.; Teixeira, E.H. Antibacterial activity of a novel antimicrobial peptide [W7]KR12-KAEK derived from KR-12 against *Streptococcus mutans* planktonic cells and biofilms. *Biofouling* 2017, 33, 835–846. [CrossRef]
- 142. Wang, Y.F.; Fan, Y.Y.; Zhou, Z.L.; Tu, H.X.; Ren, Q.; Wan, X.Q.; Ding, L.J.; Zhou, X.D.; Zhang, L.L. De novo synthetic short antimicrobial peptides against cariogenic bacteria. *Arch. Oral Biol.* 2017, *80*, 41–50. [CrossRef]
- 143. Eckert, R.; He, J.; Yarbrough, D.K.; Qi, F.X.; Anderson, M.H.; Shi, W.Y. Targeted killing of *Streptococcus mutans* by a pheromoneguided "smart" antimicrobial peptide. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **2006**, *50*, 3651–3657. [CrossRef]
- 144. Deyhle, H.; Dziadowiec, I.; Kind, L.; Thalmann, P.; Schulz, G.; Muller, B. Mineralization of Early Stage Carious Lesions In Vitro-A Quantitative Approach. *Dent. J.* **2015**, *3*, 111–122. [CrossRef]
- 145. Cao, Y.; Liu, W.; Ning, T.; Mei, M.L.; Li, Q.L.; Lo, E.C.; Chu, C.H. A novel oligopeptide simulating dentine matrix protein 1 for biomimetic mineralization of dentine. *Clin. Oral Investig.* **2014**, *18*, 873–881. [CrossRef]
- 146. Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Wu, W.K.K.; Li, Q.L.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. Remineralising dentine caries using an artificial antimicrobial peptide: An in vitro study. J. Dent. 2021, 111, 103736. [CrossRef]
- 147. Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Wu, W.K.K.; Li, Q.L.; Mei, M.L.; Chu, C.H. Efficacy of the dual-action GA-KR12 peptide for remineralising initial enamel caries: An in vitro study. *Clin. Oral Investig.* **2022**, *26*, 2441–2451. [CrossRef]
- 148. Wang, X.; Wang, Y.; Wang, K.; Ren, Q.; Li, H.; Zheng, S.; Niu, Y.; Zhou, X.; Li, W.; Zhang, L. Bifunctional anticaries peptides with antibacterial and remineralizing effects. *Oral Dis.* **2019**, *25*, 488–496. [CrossRef]
- 149. Niu, J.Y.; Yin, I.X.; Mei, M.L.; Wu, W.K.K.; Li, Q.L.; Chu, C.H. The multifaceted roles of antimicrobial peptides in oral diseases. *Mol. Oral Microbiol.* **2021**, *36*, 159–171. [CrossRef]

- 150. Toumba, K.J.; Twetman, S.; Splieth, C.; Parnell, C.; van Loveren, C.; Lygidakis, N. Guidelines on the use of fluoride for caries prevention in children: An updated EAPD policy document. *Eur. Arch. Paediatr. Dent.* **2019**, *20*, 507–516. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 151. Sedlakova Kondelova, P.; Mannaa, A.; Bommer, C.; Abdelaziz, M.; Daeniker, L.; di Bella, E.; Krejci, I. Efficacy of P(11)-4 for the treatment of initial buccal caries: A randomized clinical trial. *Sci. Rep.* **2020**, *10*, 20211. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 152. Zhang, O.L.; Niu, J.Y.; Yu, O.Y.; Mei, M.L.; Jakubovics, N.S.; Chu, C.H. Peptide Designs for Use in Caries Management: A Systematic Review. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* **2023**, *24*, 4247. [CrossRef]
- 153. Rubio, D.M.; Schoenbaum, E.E.; Lee, L.S.; Schteingart, D.E.; Marantz, P.R.; Anderson, K.E.; Platt, L.D.; Baez, A.; Esposito, K. Defining translational research: Implications for training. *Acad. Med.* **2010**, *85*, 470–475. [CrossRef]
- 154. Volk, H.D.; Stevens, M.M.; Mooney, D.J.; Grainger, D.W.; Duda, G.N. Key elements for nourishing the translational research environment. *Sci. Transl. Med.* 2015, *7*, 282cm282. [CrossRef]

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.