



Article Adoption and Applications of Blockchain Technology in Marketing: A Retrospective Overview and Bibliometric Analysis

Mohammad Wasiq ¹, Abu Bashar ², Syed Akmal ¹, Mustafa Raza Rabbani ^{3,*}, Mohd Afzal Saifi ⁴, Nishad Nawaz ⁵ and Youssef Tarek Nasef ⁶

- ¹ College of Administration and Financial Sciences, Saudi Electronic University, Riyadh 11673, Saudi Arabia
- ² School of Management, IMS Unison University, Dehradun 248009, India
- ³ Department of Accounting and Finance, British University of Bahrain, Manama 527, Bahrain
- ⁴ Centre for Distance and Online Education, Jamia Millia Islamia, New Delhi 110025, India
- ⁵ Department of Business Management, Kingdom University, Riffa 40434, Bahrain
- ⁶ Department of Management and Marketing, University of Bahrain, Manama 32038, Bahrain
- * Correspondence: m.rabbani@bub.bh

Abstract: Blockchain technology has disrupted the traditional approaches of marketing and introduced altogether contemporary marketing frameworks using its unique capabilities of decentralization, security and transparency. In recent times, this technology has attracted both academicians and practitioners to study the underlying processes and opportunities of the application of blockchain technology in marketing. Although there is an increasing deliberation in researching the use of blockchain in marketing, there exists an intermittent gap in holistic overview of the current trends and future boundaries. This article is an attempt to present a comprehensive current state and prospects of expansion in the research of the application of blockchain technology in marketing using state of the art bibliometric review analysis. The bibliometric analysis using 161 articles from Scopus database revealed the influential aspects of research such as prolific authors, influential documents, countries, affiliations, sources and keywords. Moreover, emerging research streams about the application of blockchain is identified and enumerated using network synthesis and visualization of co-citation, and keywords co-occurrence networks. These findings pave the ways for future research expansion. The results shows that the research on applications of blockchain technology has been maturing over time. However, the research streams reveal that blockchain based marketing framework is still in its infancy stage.

Keywords: blockchain marketing; bibliometric analysis; co-citations analysis; keywords co-occurrence analysis

1. Introduction

The evolution of technologies significantly transformed the way businesses were carried out. The proliferation of digital technologies, especially the internet, has offered new possibilities and is disrupting traditional business processes on a regular basis. The emergence of blockchain technology is one of the most promising and disruptive technologies that might substantially revolutionize the marketing processes and management. The adoption and application of blockchain technology by companies would entirely transform the way they interact and transact with their stakeholders and reshape their entire communication framework and processes.

Blockchain is a decentralized distributed ledger that is made up of blocks which contains highly encrypted bits of information to achieve secure [1], fast and trustworthy transactions in real-time environment [2]. The blocks are immutable, i.e., once added to the blockchain, it cannot be altered or tampered that makes block chain free from nasty



Citation: Wasiq, M.; Bashar, A.; Akmal, S.; Rabbani, M.R.; Saifi, M.A.; Nawaz, N.; Nasef, Y.T. Adoption and Applications of Blockchain Technology in Marketing: A Retrospective Overview and Bibliometric Analysis. *Sustainability* 2023, *15*, 3279. https://doi.org/ 10.3390/su15043279

Academic Editor: Cheolho Yoon

Received: 16 October 2022 Revised: 21 January 2023 Accepted: 6 February 2023 Published: 10 February 2023



Copyright: © 2023 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/). intruder or hackers to inject proxy blocks or hoax the network [3]. Moreover, blockchain technology eradicates the middle man from the processes and transactions are happening among trusted and verified parties [4]. This makes the whole process highly transparent and ultimately enroots enormous trust among the participants of a blockchain network [4].

Blockchain is usually understood as a technology being used for fintech and digital currency such as Bitcoin, Ethereum, etc. It is extensively used in the trading of cryptocurrency and other financial transactions of buying and selling where bitcoin is accepted as a mode of payment [3]. There are very few cases of use for the adoption of blockchain in marketing applications, while it has got all the potential to create a more secure and trustworthy relationship with the customers and brands [5]. The application of blockchain in marketing has revolutionized B2C payments and transactions [6], distribution tracking by customer for their ordered brand [7], loyalty programs [8,9], digital marketing programs [10–12], review management [13], internal marketing processes management [14,15] and paid click [16], etc.

The research in this subject is fragmented and in an infant stage. There are few review studies available in the existing literature that have been carried out to understand the importance of block chain technology in a certain marketing strategy, such as loyalty program, communication strategies, promotional activities and personalization [17]. There are few articles that have reviewed the application of blockchain in supply chain, tourism, finance, etc. [18,19]. Very few articles on this focusing on this phenomenon holistically and presenting a comprehensive mapping of social and intellectual structure of knowledge have been published.

Application of Blockchain Technology in Marketing

The application of blockchain technologies in marketing can give the discipline a new wing to re-activate its saturated state. It can be applied to advertising and marketing for better and efficient result. The decentralization feature of blockchain enables marketers and advertisers to manage data effectively, gain deeper insights about customer reactions to their advertisements and make sustainable customer relationship [20,21].

Blockchain can be effectively utilized for content creation and delivery, all the stakeholders of the digital assets will get real-time updates about the content. The transferability and ownership of the digital content are at the core of blockchain based content applications [22,23].

Another important application of block chain technology is in e-commerce, it enables a more efficient and flexible payment system and the deployment of an anti-fraudulent system that ensures secure online financial transactions at relatively low cost [24].

Data are another important aspect of marketing where blockchain is playing a pivotal role. Whether it is IoT data or customer related data, the decentralized mechanism makes it quite effective to use services without furnishing personal data. The customers are getting directly rewarded from the businesses if they are using customer personal information [25,26].

This article is an attempt to study, evaluate and summarize the existing literature to understand the current state of research, its social and intellectual structure and future avenues of expansion in adoption and application of blockchain technology in marketing. This article builds on the state-of-the-art bibliometric review and visual network analysis to answer the following research questions. What is the current state of research in the application of blockchain technology in marketing? What is intellectual structure, i.e., emerging trends in the adoption and application of blockchain in marketing? What are the probable areas of future research in this field? The rest of the article is arranged as follows. The research methodology and data strategies are discussed in Section 2. Section 3 addresses the bibliometric analysis, such as publication trends, best documents, authors, institutions, countries, etc. While Section 4 is based on the visualization of networks, such as co-citations analysis and keyword co-occurrence analysis. Then, Section 5 presents the future avenues of research which is followed by the conclusions in Section 6.

2. Data Strategy and Research Methodology

This research has adopted a systematic literature review approach using bibliometric analysis techniques, it is being used extensively to map the knowledge in a particular discipline of study [27]. We chose Scopus because it is the largest database of the abstract and citation database of the peer-reviewed articles [28–31]. The international database "Scopus" is used as the data source for this research, Scopus is considered as the largest database of social science and it is being used for similar studies by several authors [27,32–34]. Although Web of Science (WOS) and Scopus database overlap to great extent, Scopus is considered an extensive index of the existing social sciences literature [35]. Scopus search engine is equipped with operating functionalities, such as journal name, h-index matrix, citations matrices, etc., that enables efficient bibliometric analysis [36].

The data were searched in the "TIT-ABS-KEY" field of Scopus search engine with deliberately selected combinations of keywords syntax using logical operators AND and OR to retrieve all the possible literature in the subject area of adoption of technology in marketing, such as ("Blockchain" AND "Marketing") OR ("Blockchain" AND "Digital Marketing") OR("Blockchain Technology" AND "Marketing") OR ("Distributed Ledger" AND "Marketing") OR ("Digital Ledger" AND "Marketing") OR ("Public Transaction Ledger" AND "Marketing") OR ("Public Transaction Ledger" AND "Retail Marketing") OR ("Cryptographic Ledger" AND "Marketing") OR ("Ledger" AND "Digital Marketing"), etc. This search resulted in 378 articles which were further subjected to inclusion criteria. Only those articles which have been written in English language, final articles and of conference, article or book chapter were included. This stage reduced the data size to 269 articles. These articles were exported in a .CSV file for further screening and data preparation. Furthermore, the researchers made sure that the included articles were purely focused on the research studies having central theme of blockchain technology and marketing. The researchers looked at the tittle and abstract of each article and excluded the papers which were not falling under the scope of current research. This stage further reduced the data set to 161 articles which are finalized for further data analysis and discussion.

The data analysis was carried out in two steps. In the first step, bibliometric analysis was carried out by employing biblioshiny web-interface of R application. Biblioshiny application enables researchers to process and analyze bibliographic data in a comprehensive manner and extract the results in tabular and graphical forms for further discussion and analysis [32,37]. The performance analysis was carried out to evaluate the most influential aspects of the current state of research in adoption and application of blockchain technology in marketing, such as best documents, prolific author, institutions, countries, keywords, etc. Then, in the second stage, scientific mapping and network analysis was performed for understanding the current intellectual and social structure of research publication, network visualization and synthesis, such as co-citations and keyword co-occurrence analysis, were carried out using VOSviewer software application. VOSviewer application was widely used by the researchers in bibliometric analysis studies to build and analyze networks for publications and keywords based on the citations [38,39].

3. Bibliometric Analysis

The following section is based on the important aspects of research trends in the adoption and application of blockchain technology in marketing. The following Table 1 shows the data set characteristics used for this analysis. As is evident from the table, the data set consists of 161 articles which were published by 161 sources over a period

of 6 years. The majority of the publications had an average time of 1.24 years since publication, which shows the recency of the importance of research from the perspective of integration of blockchain in marketing. There were 6538 references used that indicated the multidisciplinary nature of research, that blockchain technology integrates subjects such as computer science, modelling in management, operations research, supply chain management and other allied areas. It is also worthwhile to note that more than 35% of the literature is conference papers that show that the research is in more of a theoretical stage and needs more time to be adopted in business applications.

Data Characteristics				
Timespan	2017:2022			
Sources (Journals, Books, etc.)	120			
Documents	161			
Average years from publication	1.24			
References	6538			
article	77			
book	1			
book chapter	17			
conference paper	57			
review	8			
Keywords Plus	791			
Author's Keywords	492			
Authors	474			
Single-authored documents	25			
Documents per Author	0.34			
Authors per Document	2.94			
Co-Authors per Documents	3.27			
Collaboration Index	3.3			

Table 1. Data Characteristics.

474 authors have produced these articles out of which only 25 papers are single authored, and rest are authored in collaboration that is amounting to 3.27 authors per documents.

3.1. Publications & Citations Trends

The annual publications and citations trends are presented in Figure 1. The first paper found in 2017 and the field grows consistently by then. The trend has seen an exponential growth during last three years which indicates the deliberations of researchers in understanding and studying probable applications of blockchain technology in marketing management. As far as citations are concerned, the articles published in the beginning have been comparatively cited more and recent articles will attract citations in the times to come. Overall, there is an upward trend in this research domain.



Figure 1. Annual Publications & Citations Trends.

3.2. Influential Documents

Table 2 shows that the 10 most influential documents, along with their total citations, have been published on the adoption and application of blockchain technology in marketing. The top document in the list is titled as "A framework for analyzing blockchain technology adoption: Integrating institutional, market and technical factors", attracted total citations of 129 since it was published in 2020. This article has investigated the various challenges in the adoption of technologies in businesses and possible integration of blockchain in businesses. The article titled "Anonymous reputation system for IIoT-enabled retail marketing atop PoS blockchain" is the most cited document having been cited 80 times since its publication in 2019. This article emphasizes on the integration and implementation of blockchain technology and Internet of Things (IoT) for retail businesses at their Point of Sales (POS). Another important document in the list is about the impact of disruptive technologies in businesses and marketing. The article "Influence of new-age technologies on marketing: A research agenda" was published in 2021 and had attracted 74 citations by then. Other documents also touched important angles of blockchain applications in marketing such as modern retailing, innovative product design, capturing users' behavior on social network and managing information on Omni channels.

Authors	Year	Source	Tittle	(TC) Total Citations	TC per Year
Janssen M	2020	International Journal of Information Management	A framework for analyzing blockchain technology adoption: Integrating institutional, market and technical factors	129	43
Liu D	2019	IEEE Transactions on Industrial Informatics	Anonymous reputation system for IIoT-enabled retail marketing atop PoS blockchain	80	20
Kumar V	2021	Journal of Business Research	Influence of new-age technologies on marketing: A research agenda	74	37
Ahluwalia S	2020	Technological Forecasting and Social Change	Blockchain technology and startup financing: A transaction cost economics perspective	67	22

Table 2. Top 10 Documents.

Authors	Year	Source	Tittle	(TC) Total Citations	TC per Year
Grewal D	2018	Journal of Marketing Education	The evolution and future of retailing and retailing education	64	13
Mansfield-Devine S	2017	Computer Fraud & Security	Beyond Bitcoin: using blockchain technology to provide assurance in the commercial world	52	9
Chen Y	2019	Information Sciences	DEPLEST: A blockchain-based privacy-preserving distributed database toward user behaviors in social networks	46	12
Rahmanzadeh S	2020	International Journal of Production Research	Integrated innovative product design and supply chain tactical planning within a blockchain platform	42	14
Cui Th	2021	Journal of Marketing	Informational challenges in omnichannel marketing: remedies and future research	38	19
Tozanli Ö	2020	International Journal of Production Research	Trade-in-to-upgrade as a marketing strategy in disassembly-to-order systems at the edge of blockchain technology	35	12

Table 2. Cont.

3.3. Most Prolific Authors

Table 3 shows the top 10 authors researching and publishing in the field of applications of blockchain technology in marketing. The authors h, g and m-indices are also presented along with total number of citations and number of publications. These indices are the indicators of the authors productivity and citations of their publications. The most prolific author in this list is "Sivarajah U", who has published 2 papers, though his publications received 162 citations. The author studied the importance and challenges of integrating blockchain technology with marketing processes. The second top author in this list is "Irani Z", with only one publication that has been cited 129 times. The paper discusses the blockchain adoption for businesses and suggested a framework for assessing the probable impact of blockchain adoption. With one publication and 129 citations, "Ismagilova E" is the third most influential author. This author is co-author with "Ismagilova E". The other authors have also contributed significantly to understanding the amalgamation of blockchain technology with marketing practices.

Table 3. Top 10 Most Important Authors.

Author	h_index	g_index	m_index	тс	NP
Sivarajah U	2	2	0.667	162	2
Irani Z	1	1	0.333	129	1
Ismagilova E	1	1	0.333	129	1
Janssen M	1	1	0.333	129	1
Weerakkody V	1	1	0.333	129	1
Lin X	2	3	0.5	84	3
Liu D	2	3	0.5	84	3
Ni J	2	3	0.5	84	3
Shen X	2	2	0.5	82	2
Alahmadi A	1	1	0.25	80	1

3.4. Most Important Countries

The publications and citations of the top 10 countries are depicted in Figure 2, author appearances are also shown, which indicate how the author of a particular country is collaborating with other authors globally. From a citation perspective, the USA, the UK and India are the top three countries. Whereas China tops the list in terms of publications, and is followed by India, the UK and the USA. The publications of the USA are more referred to and citated when compared to another countries. As far as author appearances are concerned, India has the most appearances with a score of 137, followed by China with 96 and the USA with 36. This result indicates that Indian and Chinese authors have produced more globally collaborated research compared to other countries.



Figure 2. Top 10 Countries Publications & Citations.

Figure 3 explains the collaborations among authors and the number of papers which are single-country-authored or multicountry-authored for 20 countries. Consistent with the previous results, China has the highest number of single-authored papers followed by India and the United Kingdom. A few countries, such as Portugal, Canada Greece, Tunisia, Austria, etc., have produced papers which are written by their own authors.



Figure 3. Top 20 Corresponding Author's Country.

3.5. Most Relevant Affiliations

The organizations which contributed the most to the development of the research in blockchain and marketing are presented in Figure 4. The most productive affiliation is "Guilin University of Electronic Technology" in China, it has produced 15 articles on various aspects of application of blockchain technology in marketing practices. The first article on blockchain application in marketing was published around 2013 and within a span of 9 years it contributed 15 articles which were based on the behavioral aspect of marketing. The second most influential affiliation found in this discipline of research is "Bucharest University of Economic Studies" in Romania which has published 8 articles. Next in this list is "Agricultural University of Athens" in Greece, and "University of Waterloo" in Canada, which contributed 6 articles each. The other affiliations have also contributed significantly to the development of the research in the field of blockchain integration with marketing processes.





3.6. Most Important Sources

The sources which contributed the most to the understanding and development of research in blockchain technology and marketing are presented below. Figure 5 shows the top 20 sources in terms of number of articles that they have published on this subject.

The highest number of articles (8) have been published in the book "Blockchain Technology and Applications for Digital Marketing", published by IGI global. The second highest publications are found in the conference proceedings series of "Springer Proceedings in Business and Economics" that have contributed 4 articles. The journal of "Sustainability" published by MDPI has also contributed 4 articles in the research domain of blockchain and marketing.



Figure 5. Top 20 Influential Sources.

The ranking of sources from the angle of total number of citations it received over the period is presented in Table 4. The table depicts important productivity and citations indices such as h, m and g-indices, Total Citations (TC), Number of Paper (NP) and Production Start (PY_start). The top journal/source is "International Journal of Information Management" which has been cited 129 times since its publication in 2020. The journal "Technological Forecasting and Social Change" is second in the list and attracted 100 citations since it started publication in 2020. While "Journal of Business Research" is cited 95 times and published 2 papers within a year of its first publication. It is quite obvious that the majority of the sources started publishing on blockchain marketing from 2017 onwards. It shows the evolution of blockchain in marketing within the last five years.

Table 4. Top 10 Most Important Sources.

Source	h_index	g_index	m_index	TC	NP	PY_start
International Journal of Information Management	1	1	0.33	129	1	2020
Technological Forecasting and Social Change	2	2	0.67	100	2	2020
Journal of Business Research	2	2	1.00	95	2	2021
IEEE Transactions on Industrial Informatics	1	1	0.25	80	1	2019
International Journal of Production Research	2	2	0.67	77	2	2020
International Journal of Information Management Data Insights	2	2	1.00	74	2	2021
Journal of Marketing Education	1	1	0.20	64	1	2018
Computer Fraud and Security	1	1	0.17	52	1	2017
Information Sciences	1	1	0.25	46	1	2019
Journal of Marketing	1	1	0.50	38	1	2021

3.7. Thematic Evolution

Thematic evolution is an approach which integrates performance analysis and scientific mapping to discover and visualize emerging research streams and sub-domains in a given specific research domain [40]. Thematic evolution and mapping were performed using biblioshiny application and the results are presented in Figures 6 and 7. The thematic map presents the important themes in the development stages of the research in blockchain and marketing practices (Figure 6). The four quadrants of the map exhibit the basic themes, emerging or declining themes, niche themes and motor themes. Each of these quadrants signifies the important subdomains of research, for instance, network security, supply chain and Ethereum are the niche themes which indicate that research is progressing in these areas of application of blockchain technology. Whereas data privacy, big data and digital storage are motor themes, i.e., these are main streams of the research and primarily addressed. Electronic commerce, information management, marketing and artificial intelligence are found to be the basic theme in the research of blockchain and marketing. The applications of blockchain technology in economics, agriculture, smart contract, social media, social media networking and food supply are emerging and clustered around emerging themes.



Figure 6. Thematic Map.

In addition to thematic map, a three-field plot of the research evolution is presented in Figure 7. The figure shows the relationship amongst authors keyword (left), author (middle) and tittle (right) and how they evolved over the period. Most of the keywords used by the authors are quite like the words used in the tittle of the articles. A few of the important streams which can be visualized are the amalgamation of marketing, commerce and blockchain to advertising, media and online management.



Figure 7. Three Filed Plot.

4. Network Analysis

Network analysis technique is useful in understanding the inter-relationship and inter-dependencies among the documents, authors, words, organizations sources, etc. [41]. Moreover, it helps the researchers to visualize the intellectual structure and landscape. VOSviewer application is employed for conducting network analysis, such as co-citations and keywords co-occurrence analysis that would help in identifying the key research streams to be expanded in the future.

4.1. Co-Citations Analysis

Co-citation analysis is a technique of searching, tracking and identifying an author's documents which have been cited together in another document, these documents do have a common characteristics and form a cluster [42]. The co-citation analysis of the cited authors is conducted to reveal the structure of research and presented in Figure 8. The minimum number of citations of an author was kept at 10, only 91 authors met this criterion and the network formed was thus based on four clusters having 2873 links and total link strength of 13,396.

The largest cluster of the network (violet) is made up of 27 authors, the prominent authors in this cluster are Beck, R; Jannsen, M; Tapscott, A; Tapscott, D; Crosby, M; Hawlitscheck, F, etc. These authors are researching on the important aspects of blockchain adoption and applications in marketing processes. This stream highlights the importance of technological advancement that is required for the digital transformation of the organizations specially marketing practices. Some of the important technologies, such as Internet of Things (IoT), Artificial Intelligence (AI), Machine Learning (ML), Deep Learning (DL) and Artificial Neural Network (ANN) [43], have already been applied in business and commerce and achieved better productivity, revenue and profitability [44]. The role of blockchain technology in agricultural marketing [45], digital marketing [46–48], social media [17,49] and communication [43] are some of the core themes of this cluster. This cluster further indicates that there are various unexplored facets of adoption and application of blockchain technology that need further investigation.



Figure 8. Co-Citation Network of authors.

The second cluster (red) is made up of 25 authors and is identified as the cluster containing studies which are pertaining to the application of blockchain technology in ecommerce activities. Together with big data analytics, behavioral intelligence and real time personalization e-commerce has become an important channel for attracting, engaging and assuring excellent customer experience. Some of the very important facets in this cluster are information management [46], product design [50], decentralization [51], real-time analytics [6], advertising budget [12], loyalty programs [9], reviews and feedback [52], etc. The customers on e-commerce websites are bombarded with promotional information, they are required to be handled with utmost personalization to ensure longevity of stay on the website. The longer the stay, the longer the engagement with brand which ultimately leads to sales revenue. The behavioral aspects of adoption of blockchain technology in marketing and its acceptance from customers have not been explored much, so this could be a crucial avenue for future researchers.

Third cluster (Blue) consists of 24 authors, this cluster is made around the theme of big data processing and analytics in blockchain adoption for marketing processes. Data are the most crucial component of any system, and it should be handled properly to gain important insights about the critical business processes [53]. Data analytics tools and techniques are developing day-by-day and gaining momentum in marketing applications. The big transactional data collected are needed to be analyzed using blockchain technology that can help in business modelling, such as behavioral analytics [4], digital behavior [4], demand forecasting [17], marketing budget analytics [13], etc. Big data analytics using blockchain is developing and needs more deliberation from modelling perspectives to study the probability and feasibility of adoption in marketing.

The fourth and last cluster (yellow) of the network constitutes 15 articles and based on the central theme of data privacy and security. One of the most important factors of keeping organizations and consumers away from adoption of technologies and their application is the fear of online fraud, data hacking, trust deficit, nasty intruders and network security [54]. Blockchain technology would probably solve these problems of privacy and security using highly secured digital distributed ledgers that can be tampered with and hacked [10]. The future researchers can explore the privacy and security issues of blockchain technology applications, such as consumer personal data protection, information trustworthiness, breaching of information, etc. in marketing.

A careful investigation of the network clusters reveals that data privacy and security is going to be the main focus of the marketers in adopting blockchain technology for their firms. Therefore, it will be challenging to gain customer trust that will help in attracting, engaging and transacting with target customers in a blockchain-enabled environment.

4.2. Keywords Co-Occurrence Analysis

Keyword co-occurrence analysis is a method of identifying the similarities in the content of the scientific literature, it is basically a semantic measure of the keywords used in the scientific literature [55]. Co-occurrence network analysis of author's keywords is conducted and presented in Figure 9. The minimum number of occurrences of a keyword was kept at 3, 155 keywords met the threshold and were included in the network construction. The network thus obtained has four clusters containing emerging theme of research in the application of blockchain in marketing.





The cluster (green) is the largest cluster of the network and is made up of 51 keywords. Some of the prominent keywords in this cluster are artificial intelligence, text mining, internet of things, metadata, technological innovation, emerging technologies, sustainable development, sales, retailing, consumer behavior, value creation, internet of value, etc. [6,56–58]. This cluster is about the applications of technologies in marketing, especially blockchain technology that offers utmost possibilities in varied marketing applications. These keywords emphasize the advantages of blockchain technology, namely that a marketing firm can exploit for better marketing communication, effective customer relationship management and increased sales revenue. The technological advancement has not only empowered the customers but also forced the brands to be consistent on its all channel with excellent customer experience [15].

The second cluster (red) consists of 37 keywords. This cluster has keywords such as data privacy, smart contracts, security perseverance, privacy, trust, security, cybersecurity,

transparency, digital marketing [13,52,59,60], etc. This cluster specifies the privacy and security of blockchain based marketing applications. This result is consistent with the results of co-citation analysis where data security and privacy has emerged as one of the core clusters of the research in applications of blockchain in marketing. Moreover, it also indicates that security is the key for keeping customers and other stakeholder's trust in blockchain's applications in marketing domain.

The cluster (blue) is made up of 34 keywords. Some of the prominent words are agricultural robots, cross border, cryptography, information management, online marketing, digital marketing, digital storage [4,13,50,61], etc. It highlights the applications of blockchain technology in agricultural marketing, international business and information management. Blockchain technology has been applied to agriculture and supply chain management which resulted in excellent performance because of its capabilities of bypassing third party and availability of transactional information in real-time to all the agreed stakeholders on the chain [62–64]. It has revolutionized cross-border trade because of its unique features of decentralized mechanism, as well as a high level of trust because of its immutability [65,66].

The smallest cluster (yellow) constitutes 33 keywords. The keywords are decentralization, fraud prevention, crime, cybersecurity, agricultural technology, ecosystems, online systems, online advertising, etc. This cluster indicates the role of blockchain technology towards economic development, it constitutes keywords that indicate critical aspects of blockchain technology in marketing, such as security, applications and economic systems [67,68]. Additionally, it can also be noted that the keyword online systems, online advertising and online advertising budget indicate the use of blockchain technology in online businesses. Social media networks have applied blockchain technology to target their users with real time behavioral intelligence and noticed significant growth in sales revenue [58,69].

Trends in the blockchain marketing are promising and are going to be at the center point of marketing campaign and other consumer-related activities. The technology enable chat bots, AR/VR and virtual trial rooms will revolutionize the retailing landscape. Moreover, online marketing in general and online consumer behavior shall be disrupted and give rise to altogether new economic framework of business.

5. Future Research Directions

The critical investigation of the clusters formed by co-citations and keyword cooccurrence analysis, along with other bibliometric analysis of the following research streams and sub-streams, are identified. They need further exploration to understand the complexity and applicability of blockchain technologies in marketing.

Table 5 shows the emerging streams and sub-streams that shall be studied further to answer the questions and fills the gaps in the literature. Some of the key future research questions in the implementation of blockchain technology for marketing applications are handling of big data and its analytics to deep dive into customers insights that can help in designing efficient marketing strategies. It is worthwhile to note that blockchain technology in marketing applications is known to be a recent affair and most of the trends were found between 2017 to 2022. Another important area of concern is the designing and testing of a blockchain-based marketing applications model that can be applied to online businesses especially e-commerce. There are very few articles that emphasized the integration of blockchain and marketing, more deliberations are required to study the interlinkage amongst them. Moreover, the future of marketing because of blockchain integration shall also be thoroughly examined. As the most crucial aspect of implementation of blockchain applications in marketing is privacy and security, there is an urgent need of research in studying these challenges and proposing frameworks for combating privacy and security issues on blockchain-based applications.

Main Strems	Sub-Streams	References	
	Social media platforms	[58,69]	
	Social media networks	[58,70,71]	
	Digital Marketing	[72–75]	
Blockchain Marketing	e-commerce	[76–78]	
	Product design	[7,17,79]	
	Behavioral Research	[17,80]	
	Internet of value	[81-83]	
	Digital Storage	[67,84]	
	Big Data Analytics	[13,81,85,86]	
Rlockshain & Data	Data Mining	[43,53,87]	
DIOCKCItalit & Data	Cryptography	[4,88]	
	Forecasting	[89–91]	
	Predictive analytics	[92,93]	
	Data Privacy	[94,95]	
Blockchain data privacy & Security	Fraud Detection	[96,97]	
	Transparency	[4,12,83]	
	Data corruption	[98,99]	
	Smart Contracts	[100-102]	
	Network Security	[51,103]	

Table 5. Research Streams and Sub-Strems of Blockchain Applications in Marketing.

6. Conclusions

The future of marketing appears to be drastically transformed with the adoption of blockchain technology. Marketing will substantially benefit from the unique features of blockchain technology, such as real time reviews and feedback, cost savings, risk mitigation and superb customer satisfaction. The current study is unique in the sense that very few studies have critically examined the adoption and application of blockchain technology in marketing. This study has adopted a state-of-the-art bibliometric analysis using biblioshiny application coupled with network visualization techniques through VOSviewer application. A number of 161 articles from Scopus database were used for conducting bibliometric analysis which helped in enumerating the current state of the research and identifying the prominent aspects of the literature in the adoption and application of blockchain technology in marketing. The research streams and sub-streams were identified using network visualization techniques that enable the researcher to frame future research questions and avenues for expansion.

This study substantially contributes to the existing knowledge of blockchain technology adoption in marketing by highlighting (a) publications and citations trend, prolific authors, influential documents, most contributing country, important affiliations, most contributing source and thematic evolution; (b) identification of emerging research themes viz. Blockchain marketing, blockchain and Data, Blockchain data security and privacy and c) suggesting future research avenues. The above contributions signify its importance for academicians, as well as practioners. The marketing strategies can be designed using the various tools available because of blockchain proliferation.

This research study is subject to few limitations. The Scopus database was used for article extraction and there might be good quality articles which are not indexed in Scopus database. Moreover, bibliometric analysis is based on the citations' metrics, good quality articles having less citations may not be included in the analysis. Future studies can adopt

other techniques and databases to accommodate maximum articles based on the research of applications of blockchain technology in marketing.

Author Contributions: All authors contributed to conceptualization, formal analysis, investigation, methodology, and writing and editing of the original draft. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Informed consent was obtained from the respondents of the survey.

Data Availability Statement: The data used to support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon request.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- 1. Chang, S.E.; Chang, E.C.; Chen, Y. Blockchain Meets Sharing Economy: A Case of Smart Contract Enabled Ridesharing Service. *Sustainability* 2022, 14, 13732. [CrossRef]
- 2. Gleim, M.R.; Stevens, J.L. Blockchain: A game changer for marketers? Mark. Lett. 2021, 32, 123–128. [CrossRef]
- 3. Faria, I. Trust, reputation and ambiguous freedoms: Financial institutions and subversive libertarians navigating blockchain, markets, and regulation. *J. Cult. Econ.* **2019**, *12*, 119–132. [CrossRef]
- Ajjan, H.; Harrison, D.E.; Green, J.; Ajeetha, N.S.; Wang, H. Special Session: Blockchain Technology and How It Will Change Marketing: An Abstract. In Marketing Opportunities and Challenges in a Changing Global Marketplace: Proceedings of the 2019 Academy of Marketing Science (AMS) Annual Conference; Springer International Publishing: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2020; pp. 673–674.
- Bathla, D.; Ahuja, R.; Awasthi, S.; Singh, K. Role of Blockchain and Data Visualisation in Advertisement Lead Purchase Across Social Media. In *Developing Relationships, Personalization, and Data Herald in Marketing 5.0*; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2022; pp. 88–108.
- Antoniadis, I.; Spinthiropoulos, K.; Kontsas, S. Blockchain Applications in Tourism and Tourism Marketing: A Short Review. In *Strategic Innovative Marketing and Tourism*; Springer Proceedings in Business and Economics; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2020; pp. 375–384. [CrossRef]
- 7. Rahmanzadeh, S.; Pishvaee, M.S.; Rasouli, M.R. Integrated innovative product design and supply chain tactical planning within a blockchain platform. *Int. J. Prod. Res.* 2020, *58*, 2242–2262. [CrossRef]
- Sun, D.; Ying, W.; Zhang, X.; Feng, L. Developing a Blockchain-based Loyalty Programs System to Hybridize Business and Charity: An Action Design Research. In Proceedings of the International Conference on Information Systems (ICIS) 2019 Conference, Munich, Germany, 15–18 December 2019. Available online: https://aisel.aisnet.org/icis2019/design_science/design_science/6 (accessed on 10 September 2022).
- 9. Manjunatha, M.S.; Usha, S.; Bhat, C.C.; Manu, R.; Kavya, S. Blockchain based loyalty platform. *Int. J. Recent Technol. Eng.* 2019, 7, 1648–1652.
- Sidana, A.; Jindal, T.; Pandey, U.K.; Singh, J.; Vasantham, S.T.; Bhanushali, M.M. Investigation of Block chain Technology Based on Digital Management System with Data Mining Technology for Green Marketing. In Proceedings of the 2022 2nd International Conference on Advance Computing and Innovative Technologies in Engineering, ICACITE 2022, Greater Noida, India, 28–29 April 2022; pp. 1309–1313. [CrossRef]
- 11. Liu, Y. Effect of Digital Marketing Capabilities and Blockchain Technology on Organizational Performance and Psychology. *Front. Psychol.* **2022**, *12*, 805393. [CrossRef]
- 12. Rahman, K.T. Applications of blockchain technology for digital marketing: A systematic review. In *Blockchain Technology and Applications for Digital Marketing*; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2021; pp. 16–31.
- Jain, D.; Dash, M.K.; Kumar, A.; Luthra, S. How is Blockchain used in marketing: A review and research agenda. Int. J. Inf. Manag. Data Insights 2021, 1, 100044. [CrossRef]
- Chhabra, R.; Singh, R.; Bagga, T. Application of Blockchain in Marketing. In Proceedings of the 2021 9th International Conference on Reliability, Infocom Technologies and Optimization (Trends and Future Directions) (ICRITO), Noida, India, 3–4 September 2021. [CrossRef]
- 15. de Oliveira Rodrigues, D. Marketing-Mix Metamorphosis and New Trusted Business Practices. In *Competitive Drivers for Improving Future Business Performance;* IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2021; pp. 46–66.
- Krafft, M.; Sajtos, L.; Haenlein, M. Challenges and Opportunities for Marketing Scholars in Times of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. J. Interact. Mark. 2020, 51, 1–8. [CrossRef]
- 17. Peres, R.; Schreier, M.; Schweidel, D.A.; Sorescu, A. Blockchain meets marketing: Opportunities, threats, and avenues for future research. *Int. J. Res. Mark.* 2022. [CrossRef]

- 18. Gong, Y.; Zhang, Y.; Alharithi, M. Supply Chain Finance and Blockchain in Operations Management: A Literature Review. *Sustainability* **2022**, *14*, 13450. [CrossRef]
- Rana, R.L.; Adamashvili, N.; Tricase, C. The Impact of Blockchain Technology Adoption on Tourism Industry: A Systematic Literature Review. Sustainability 2022, 14, 7383. [CrossRef]
- Kaur, R.; Singh, R.; Gehlot, A.; Priyadarshi, N.; Twala, B. Marketing Strategies 4.0: Recent Trends and Technologies in Marketing. Sustainability 2022, 14, 16356. [CrossRef]
- Jevremović, M.; Staletić, N.; Orzan, G.; Ilić, M.P.; Jelić, Z.; Bălăceanu, C.T.; Paraschiv, O.V. Predicting User Behaviour Based on the Level of Interactivity Implemented in Blockchain Technologies in Websites and Used Devices. *Sustainability* 2022, 14, 2216. [CrossRef]
- 22. Giungato, P.; Rana, R.; Tarabella, A.; Tricase, C. Current trends in sustainability of bitcoins and related blockchain technology. *Sustainability* **2017**, *9*, 2214. [CrossRef]
- 23. Park, H.L. The effect of blockchain technology on supply chain sustainability performances. *Sustainability* **2021**, *13*, 1726. [CrossRef]
- Frizzo-Barker, J.; Chow-White, P.A.; Adams, P.R.; Mentanko, J.; Ha, D.; Green, S. Blockchain as a disruptive technology for business: A systematic review. *Int. J. Inf. Manag.* 2020, 51, 102029. [CrossRef]
- Chen, P.-W.; Jiang, B.-S.; Wang, C.-H. Blockchain-based payment collection supervision system using pervasive Bitcoin digital wallet. In Proceedings of the 13th IEEE International Conference on Wireless and Mobile Computing, Networking and Communications, WiMob 2017, Rome, Italy, 9–11 October 2017; pp. 139–146. [CrossRef]
- Lee, Y.; Son, B.; Park, S.; Lee, J.; Jang, H. A survey on security and privacy in blockchain-based central bank digital currencies. J. Internet Serv. Inf. Secur. 2021, 11, 16–29. [CrossRef]
- 27. Hassan, M.K.; Rabbani, M.R.; Brodmann, J.; Bashar, A.; Grewal, H. Bibliometric and Scientometric analysis on CSR practices in the banking sector. *Rev. Financ. Econ.* 2022. [CrossRef]
- Rabbani, M.R.; Bashar, A.; Hawaldar, I.T.; Shaik, M.; Selim, M. What Do We Know about Crowdfunding and P2P Lending Research? A Bibliometric Review and Meta-Analysis. J. Risk Financ. Manag. 2022, 15, 451. [CrossRef]
- 29. Naeem, M.A.; Karim, S.; Rabbani, M.R.; Bashar, A.; Kumar, S. Current State and Future Directions of Green and Sustainable Finance: A Bibliometric Analysis. *Qual. Res. Financ. Mark.* 2022, *ahead-of-print*.
- Basher, A.; Jreisat, J.; Kaur, S.; Al-Mohamad, S.; Rabbani, M.R. Looking into Corporate Boardrooms Through the Lens of Gender Diversity: A Bibliometric Review and META Analysis. *Int. J. Sustain. Dev. Plan.* 2022, 17, 1593–1603. [CrossRef]
- Hassan, M.K.; Bashar, A.; Rabbani, M.R.; Choudhury, T. An Insight into the Fintech and Islamic Finance Literature: A Bibliometric and Visual Analysis. In *FinTech in Islamic Financial Institutions*; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2022; pp. 131–156.
- 32. Singh, S.; Bashar, A. A bibliometric review on the development in e-tourism research. *Int. Hosp. Rev.* 2021, *ahead-of-print*. [CrossRef]
- Bashar, A.; Rabbani, M.R.; Khan, S.; Moh'd Ali, M.A. Data driven finance: A bibliometric review and scientific mapping. In Proceedings of the 2021 International Conference on Data Analytics for Business and Industry, ICDABI 2021, Sakheer, Bahrain, 25–26 October 2021; pp. 161–166. [CrossRef]
- 34. Bashar, A.; Singh, S.; Pathak, V.K. A Bibliometric Review of Online Impulse Buying Behavior Literature. *Int. J. Electron. Bus.* 2021, 17, 162–183. [CrossRef]
- 35. Ferreira, F.G.D.C.; Gandomi, A.H.; Cardoso, R.T.N. Artificial Intelligence Applied to Stock Market Trading: A Review. *IEEE Access* 2021, *9*, 30898–30917. [CrossRef]
- Haque, M.I.; Ahmad, S.; Azad, M.S. Mapping of scientific literature on Islamic Economics, Banking and Finance 1955 to 2020. *Libr. Philos. Pract.* 2020, 2020, 1–29.
- Bashar, A.; Singh, S. Impulsive buying on social media platforms: A bibliometric review. J. Contemp. Issues Bus. Gov. 2022, 28, 386–420.
- 38. Tripathi, A.; Dixit, A.; Vipul. Liquidity of financial markets: A review. Stud. Econ. Financ. 2020, 37, 201–227. [CrossRef]
- 39. Secundo, G.; Del Vecchio, P.; Mele, G. Social media for entrepreneurship: Myth or reality? A structured literature review and a future research agenda. *Int. J. Entrep. Behav. Res.* **2021**, 27, 149–177. [CrossRef]
- 40. Wu, P.-S. Fintech trends relationships research: A bibliometric citation meta-analysis. In Proceedings of the 17th International Conference on Electronic Business: Smart Cities, ICEB 2017, Dubai, United Arab Emirates, 4–8 December 2017; pp. 99–105. Available online: https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85057761853&partnerID=40&md5=1ac0643d1778dd4 332de3e52e0443b59 (accessed on 10 September 2022).
- 41. Khan, A.; Goodell, J.W.; Hassan, M.K.; Paltrinieri, A. A bibliometric review of finance bibliometric papers. *Financ. Res. Lett.* **2022**, 47, 102520.
- 42. Akter, S.; Uddin, M.H.; Tajuddin, A.H. Knowledge mapping of microfinance performance research: A bibliometric analysis. *Int. J. Soc. Econ.* **2021**, *48*, 399–418. [CrossRef]
- 43. Kumar, V.; Ramachandran, D.; Kumar, B. Influence of new-age technologies on marketing: A research agenda. J. Bus. Res. 2021, 125, 864–877. [CrossRef]
- 44. Chao, S. Construction Model of E-Commerce Agricultural Product Online Marketing System Based on Blockchain and Improved Genetic Algorithm. *Secur. Commun. Netw.* **2022**, 2022, 4055698. [CrossRef]

- Enescu, F.M.; Ionescu, V.M. Using Blockchain in the agri-food sector following SARS-CoV-2 pandemic. In Proceedings of the 2020 12th International Conference on Electronics, Computers and Artificial Intelligence (ECAI), Bucharest, Romania, 25–27 June 2020. [CrossRef]
- 46. Yan, C.; Zhu, J.; Ouyang, Y.; Zeng, X. Marketing Method and System Optimization Based on the Financial Blockchain of the Internet of Things. *Wirel. Commun. Mob. Comput.* **2021**, 2021, 9354569. [CrossRef]
- Macdonald, J.C.; Isom, D.C.; Evans, D.D.; Page, K.J. Digital Innovation in Medicinal Product Regulatory Submission, Review, and Approvals to Create a Dynamic Regulatory Ecosystem—Are We Ready for a Revolution? *Front. Med.* 2021, *8*, 660808. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Erragcha, N.; Babay, H. Blockchain towards decentralized digital marketing. In *Blockchain Technology and Applications for Digital Marketing*; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2021; pp. 32–51.
- Myalo, S.; Glukhov, N.Y. Factors of success of initial coin offering. empirical evidence from 2016–2019. *Financ. Theory Pract.* 2019, 23, 30–49. [CrossRef]
- 50. Verma, J.; Kaur, J. Blockchain Technology: How will it impact the Marketing Domain? In *Developing Relationships, Personalization, and Data Herald in Marketing* 5.0; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2022; pp. 146–160.
- Jena, A. Blockchain Marketplace—A Novel Overview for Real-Time Implementation. In International Conference on Emerging Wireless Communication Technologies and Information Security EWCIS 2020; LNEE; Springer Science and Business Media Deutschland GmbH: Singapore, 2021; Volume 740, pp. 215–227. [CrossRef]
- Mukherjee, S.; Chittipaka, V.; Baral, M.M. Developing a model to highlight the relation of digital trust with privacy and security for the blockchain technology. In *Blockchain Technology and Applications for Digital Marketing*; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2021; pp. 110–125.
- 53. Wang, C. Research on Big Data and Blockchain Mining Methods for Music Fan Users. In Proceedings of the 2020 3rd International Conference on Smart BlockChain, SmartBlock 2020, Zhengzhou, China, 23–25 October 2020; pp. 215–219. [CrossRef]
- 54. van der Linde, T. Building trust in a digitizing world. In Proceedings of the 32nd Bled eConference Humanizing Technology for a Sustainable Society, Bled, Slovenia, 16–19 June 2019; pp. 1207–1217. [CrossRef]
- 55. Corvo, L.; Pastore, L.; Manti, A.; Iannaci, D. Mapping social impact assessment models: A literature overview for a future research Agenda. *Sustainability* **2021**, *13*, 4750. [CrossRef]
- Ding, Y.; Luo, D.; Xiang, H.; Tang, C.; Liu, L.; Zou, X.; Li, S.; Wang, Y. A Blockchain-Based Digital Advertising Media Promotion System. In Proceedings of the Security and Privacy in New Computing Environments: Second EAI International Conference, SPNCE 2019, Tianjin, China, 13–14 April 2019; Volume 284.
- 57. Chen, W.; Xu, Z.; Shi, S.; Zhao, Y.; Zhao, J. A survey of blockchain applications in different domains. In Proceedings of the 2018 International Conference on Blockchain Technology and Application, Xi'an, China, 10–12 December 2018; pp. 17–21. [CrossRef]
- 58. Rathnakar, G. Blockchain marketing through social media surges the economic growth of India. *Int. J. Recent Technol. Eng.* **2019**, *8*, 78–81.
- 59. Przhedetskiy, Y.V.; Przhedetskaya, N.V.; Borzenko, K.V.; Bondarenko, V.A. Blockchain technologies in healthcare institutions: Focus on security and effective cooperation with the government. *Int. J. Econ. Bus. Adm.* **2019**, *7*, 92–99. [CrossRef]
- 60. Liu, D.; Huang, C.; Ni, J.; Lin, X.; Shen, X.S. Blockchain-Cloud Transparent Data Marketing: Consortium Management and Fairness. *IEEE Trans. Comput.* **2022**, *71*, 3322–3335. [CrossRef]
- Coita, C.; Ban, O. Revolutionizing Marketing in Tourism Industry Through Blockchain Technology. In *Strategic Innovative Marketing and Tourism*; Springer Proceedings in Business and Economics; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2020; pp. 789–797.
 [CrossRef]
- Sundaram, B.; Wako, M.D.A.; Pandey, A.; Genale, M.A.S.; Janga, M.; Karthika, P. Supply Chain Management Finance Application in Bank Official Website using Blockchain. In Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Intelligent Computing and Control Systems, ICICCS 2022, Madurai, India, 25–27 May 2022; pp. 812–817. [CrossRef]
- 63. David, A.; Kumar, C.G.; Paul, P.V. Blockchain technology in the food supply chain: Empirical analysis. *Int. J. Inf. Syst. Supply Chain Manag.* 2022, *15*, 1–12. [CrossRef]
- 64. Dua, S.; Sharma, M.G.; Mishra, V.; Kulkarni, S.D. Modelling perceived risk in blockchain enabled supply chain utilizing fuzzy-AHP. J. Glob. Oper. Strateg. Sourc. 2022, ahead-of-print. [CrossRef]
- 65. Guo, Z. The Marketing of Cross-border E-commerce Enterprises in Foreign Trade Based on the Statistics of Mathematical Probability Theory. *Appl. Math. Nonlinear Sci.* 2022, *ahead-of-print.* [CrossRef]
- Savelyeva, N.K.; Timkina, T.A. 'Smart Technologies' as a Mechanism for Regulating Bank Competition in Cross-Border Markets. In Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems; Springer Science and Business Media: Cham, Switzerland, 2021; Volume 155, pp. 1322–1330. [CrossRef]
- 67. Ekramifard, A.; Amintoosi, H.; Seno, A.H. A systematic literature review of integration of blockchain and artificial intelligence. In *Advances in Information Security*; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2020; Volume 79, pp. 147–160. [CrossRef]
- 68. Reshetnikova, N.; Magomedov, M.; Buklanov, D. Digital Finance Technologies: Threats and Challenges to the Global and National Financial Security. *IOP Conf. Ser. Earth Environ. Sci.* 2021, 666, 062139. [CrossRef]
- 69. Liu, L.; Zhang, W.; Han, C. A survey for the application of blockchain technology in the media. *Peer-to-Peer Netw. Appl.* **2021**, *14*, 3143–3165. [CrossRef]

- Chellappan, S.; Choo, K.-K.R.; Phan, N. Computational Data and Social Networks—9th International Conference, CSoNet 2020, Dallas, TX, USA, December 11–13, 2020, Proceedings; Lecture Notes in Computer Science 12575; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2020; ISBN 978-3-030-66045-1.
- 71. Poongodi, T.; Sujatha, R.; Sumathi, D.; Suresh, P.; Balamurugan, B. Blockchain in social networking. In *Cryptocurrencies and Blockchain Technology Applications*; Wiley: Hoboken, NJ, USA, 2020; pp. 55–76.
- Khan, H.; Kushwah, K.K. Blockchain and the Future of Digital Marketing. In Blockchain Technology and Applications for Digital Marketing; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2021; pp. 250–275.
- Sheremetyeva, E.N.; Gorshkova, L.A.; Mitropolskaya-Rodionova, N.V. Digital Marketing Transformation: Trends and Realities. In *Digital Technologies in the New Socio-Economic Reality*; Springer International Publishing: Cham, Switzerland, 2021; pp. 497–504.
- 74. Rowan, N.J. The role of digital technologies in supporting and improving fishery and aquaculture across the supply chain—Quo Vadis? *Aquac. Fish.* **2022**. [CrossRef]
- 75. Bhadeshiya, H.B. Role of Cryptocurrency in Digital Marketing. In *Blockchain Technology and Applications for Digital Marketing*; IGI Global: Hershey, PA, USA, 2021; pp. 64–83.
- Peng, W. Decentralized storage design of SNS open ecommerce marketing model. In Proceedings of the 5th International Conference on I-SMAC (IoT in Social, Mobile, Analytics and Cloud), I-SMAC 2021, Palladam, India, 11–13 November 2021; pp. 909–912. [CrossRef]
- 77. Stallone, V.; Wetzels, M.; Klaas, M. Applications of Blockchain Technology in marketing—A systematic review of marketing technology companies. *Blockchain Res. Appl.* **2021**, *2*, 100023. [CrossRef]
- 78. Garg, S.; Gupta, S.; Gupta, B. Issues and challenges with fake reviews in Digital Marketing. In Proceedings of the 2022 International Conference on Computer Communication and Informatics (ICCCI), Coimbatore, India, 25–27 January 2022. [CrossRef]
- 79. Dionysis, S.; Chesney, T.; McAuley, D. Examining the influential factors of consumer purchase intentions for blockchain traceable coffee using the theory of planned behaviour. *Br. Food J.* **2022**, *124*, 4304–4322. [CrossRef]
- Wang, H.; Zhang, M.; Ying, H.; Zhao, X. The impact of blockchain technology on consumer behavior: A multimethod study. J. Manag. Anal. 2021, 8, 371–390. [CrossRef]
- Cui, T.H.; Ghose, A.; Halaburda, H.; Iyengar, R.; Pauwels, K.; Sriram, S.; Tucker, C.; Venkataraman, S. Informational Challenges in Omnichannel Marketing: Remedies and Future Research. J. Mark. 2021, 85, 103–120. [CrossRef]
- 82. Treiblmaier, H. Beyond blockchain: How tokens trigger the internet of value and what marketing researchers need to know about them. *J. Mark. Commun.* **2021**. [CrossRef]
- 83. Ben Amor, N.; Ben Yahia, I. Investigating Blockchain Technology Effects on Online Platforms Transactions: Do Risk Aversion and Technophilia Matter? *J. Internet Commer.* 2022, 21, 271–296. [CrossRef]
- Taborda, C.H.C.; Vásquez, J.G.; Marin, C.E.M.; García, P.G.; García, N.G. Decentralized application for the classification of products based on IPFS and blockchain. *RISTI-Rev. Iber. Sist. Tecnol. Inf.* 2020, 2020, 204–215.
- 85. Garg, S.; Gupta, S.; Gupta, B. Impacts of Blockchain on Digital Marketing. In *Intelligent Sustainable Systems: Selected Papers of WorldS4* 2021; Springer: Singapore, 2022; Volume 1, pp. 209–217.
- Sagara, H.; Das, K. Technological Disruptions and the Indian IT industry: Employment Concerns and Beyond; Springer: Singapore, 2020; pp. 119–143.
- Hil, A.M.; Al-Wesabi, F.N.; Alsolai, H.; Ali, O.A.O.; Nemri, N.; Hamza, M.A.; Zamani, A.S.; Rizwanullah, M. Cryptonight mining algorithm with yac consensus for social media marketing using blockchain. *Comput. Mater. Contin.* 2022, 71, 3921–3936. [CrossRef]
- Tan, T.M.; Saraniemi, S. Trust in blockchain-enabled exchanges: Future directions in blockchain marketing. J. Acad. Mark. Sci. 2022. [CrossRef]
- Amitesh; Kumar, D. Blockchain-based solution for Demand Forecasting in Supply chain. In Proceedings of the 1st International Conference on Advances in Computing and Future Communication Technologies, ICACFCT 2021, Meerut, India, 16–17 December 2021; pp. 217–224. [CrossRef]
- 90. Garg, P.; Gupta, B.; Chauhan, A.K.; Sivarajah, U.; Gupta, S.; Modgil, S. Measuring the perceived benefits of implementing blockchain technology in the banking sector. *Technol. Forecast. Soc. Chang.* **2021**, *163*, 120407. [CrossRef]
- 91. De Bernardi, P.; Azucar, D.; Forliano, C.; Franco, M. Innovative and sustainable food business models. In *Contributions to Management Science*; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2020; pp. 189–221. [CrossRef]
- 92. Lee, H.; Kweon, E.; Kim, M.; Chai, S. Does implementation of big data analytics improve firms' market value? Investors' reaction in stock market. *Sustainability* 2017, *9*, 978. [CrossRef]
- Jaimahaprabhu, V.; Kumar, P.; Gangadharan, P.S.; Latha, B. Cloud Analytics based Farming with Predictive Analytics using Artificial Intelligence. In Proceedings of the 5th IEEE International Conference on Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics, ICONSTEM 2019, Chennai, India, 14–15 March 2019; pp. 65–68. [CrossRef]
- 94. Hameed, I. Blockchain and cryptocurrencies technology: A survey. Int. J. Inform. Vis. 2019, 3, 355–360. [CrossRef]
- 95. Gietzmann, M.; Grossetti, F. Blockchain and other distributed ledger technologies: Where is the accounting? *J. Acc. Public Policy* **2021**, *40*, 106881. [CrossRef]
- 96. Aljabr, A.; Sharma, A.; Kumar, K. Mining process in cryptocurrency using blockchain technology: Bitcoin as a case study. *J. Comput. Theor. Nanosci.* 2019, *16*, 4293–4298. [CrossRef]

- 97. Akar, S.; Akar, E. Is it a new tulip mania age? A comprehensive literature review beyond cryptocurrencies, bitcoin, and blockchain technology. *J. Inf. Technol. Res.* 2020, *13*, 44–67. [CrossRef]
- Liao, C.H.; Lin, H.E.; Yuan, S.M. Blockchain-Enabled Integrated Market Platform for Contract Production. *IEEE Access* 2020, 8, 211007–211027. [CrossRef]
- Uddin, M. Blockchain Medledger: Hyperledger fabric enabled drug traceability system for counterfeit drugs in pharmaceutical industry. Int. J. Pharm. 2021, 597, 120235. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Jain, A.; Tripathi, A.K.; Chandra, N.; Chinnasamy, P. Smart Contract enabled Online Examination System Based in Blockchain Network. In Proceedings of the 2021 International Conference on Computer Communication and Informatics (ICCCI), Coimbatore, India, 27–29 January 2021. [CrossRef]
- 101. Gupta, R.; Tanwar, S.; Al-Turjman, F.; Italiya, P.; Nauman, A.; Kim, S.W. Smart Contract Privacy Protection Using AI in Cyber-Physical Systems: Tools, Techniques and Challenges. *IEEE Access* 2020, *8*, 24746–24772. [CrossRef]
- Kumarathunga, M.; Calheiros, R.N.; Ginige, A. Smart Agricultural Futures Market: Blockchain Technology as a Trust Enabler between Smallholder Farmers and Buyers. *Sustainability* 2022, 14, 2916. [CrossRef]
- Yuen, K.F.; Saidi, M.S.B.; Bai, X.; Wang, X. Cruise transport service usage post COVID-19: The health belief model application. *Transp. Policy* 2021, 111, 185–196. [CrossRef]

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.